Social audit on abuse against women: workshopping annex

Anne Cockcroft, Neil Andersson, Khalid Omer, Noor Ansari, Amir Khan and Ubaid Ullah Chaudhry
Social audit on abuse against women

Final report

Annex 6

Workshopping to develop action plans

CIETinternational
August 2004

A Cockcroft, N Andersson, K Omer, N Ansari, A Khan, UU Chaudhry
## Contents

### METHODS
- Initial consultations with provincial women development departments 3
- Formation and activities of working groups 3
- Provincial plenary workshops to feedback and discuss policy recommendations 4

### RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE WORKING GROUPS
- Economic and employment factors 5
- Educational factors 9
- Socio-cultural attitudes and practices 13
- Reporting abuse 16

### MINUTES OF PROVINCIAL PLENARY WORKSHOPS
- Punjab plenary workshop 22
- Sindh plenary workshop 30
- Balochistan plenary workshop 45
- NWFP plenary workshop 55

### PRESS CLIPPING FROM PLENARY WORKSHOPS
- Punjab press clippings 62
- Sindh press clippings 66
- Balochistan press clippings 74
Methods

The concept behind generating highly targeted compelling evidence is that it builds up to action. The areas of action that have been identified from the definitive analysis of the SAAAW reflect not only the quantitative enquiry. They are also a product of interaction with the communities, the local leaders, public services, government officials and civil society representatives. A key component of this interaction was the provincial stakeholders’ workshopping process. With the endorsement of the Ministry of Women Development, the SAAAW team worked closely with the women development departments\(^1\) in each province to discuss and make use of the findings to develop evidence-based action plans and policy recommendations. The workshopping process aimed at:

- Sharing the findings from the Social Audit on Abuse Against Women (SAAAW) with government and other stakeholders
- Discussing possible actions to address the actionable factors related to the risk of abuse
- Developing policy recommendations to guide national and provincial governments to take necessary actions
- Identifying and discussing the role of other stakeholders in civil society and the private sector that could act as a change agents

The workshopping process comprised a detailed interaction with a series of carefully convened stakeholders groups (government, academia, NGOs, civil society) led by the provincial women development departments. The interaction drew out the actionable findings from the survey and developed practical partnerships which could participate in implementing interventions. In view of the potentially sensitive nature of some of the findings from SAAAW, the team proceeded carefully, ensuring that the findings were not prematurely publicised in a sensational manner, which would have reduced the chances of constructive dialogue and development of evidence based action plans. Members of the stakeholder working groups were asked to treat the findings that were shared with them as confidential.

---

\(^{1}\) The term “women development department” is used here to include departments of social welfare and women development, and other charges of the departments in the different provinces.
Initial consultations with provincial women development departments

The details of the workshopping process varied somewhat between provinces and were finalized in consultation with the women development department in each province. Following the preliminary key findings report and the completion of the focus group discussions and key informant interviews, with approval of the MOWD the SAAAW team made an internal presentation of the main SAAAW findings to the women development department in each province. These meetings mostly took place in early 2004. In these closed presentations the focus was on the factors related to the risk of abuse against women, rather than simply on the overall frequency of the various forms of abuse. The meetings concluded with agreement on the areas for potential action and plans for the workshopping process in the province, to be led by the women development department. In all four provinces the women development departments agreed that the areas for action, based on the evidence, could be conveniently divided into four groups:

- Educational factors
- Economic and employment factors
- Socio-cultural attitudes and practices
- Reporting of abuse

Formation and activities of working groups

Based on the key areas identified for potential action arising from the SAAAW evidence, the women development department in each province set up working groups to discuss the evidence and deliberate on the possible actions. One working group was convened for each action area and comprised representatives from concerned government line departments and service institutions, and NGOs and other civil society representatives working in the same sector. The provincial women development departments took lead in identifying and inviting participants to these groups.

In the first meeting of each working group the CIET team presented the relevant evidence with an explanation of the background about the SAAAW. The evidence review included a summary of the factors that, if changed, could potentially reduce the risk of different types of abuse against women. The evidence came from both quantitative risk analysis and qualitative information from the focus groups and key informants. Following this initial presentation the group discussed their understanding and
interpretation of the findings, incorporating the rich individual experiences of the individual participants. To facilitate a structured approach to discussion, a framework was developed that helped to focus action recommendations at various levels and to categorize them into short, medium and long term strategies in relation to the desired outcome.

Following the initial meeting each group met several times before concluding upon their final recommendations. During the process the groups also reviewed relevant information that was available from other sources including the existing status of legislation, policies and their implementation. If needed other people that could contribute to the group deliberations were also invited to attend meetings. The final recommendations of the groups were directed to address each identified risk factor in the form of policy implications and actions needed at different levels, such as community, district, province and federal. For each recommended action the group also identified the target group for action, potential key players who could take the recommended action and the resource requirement and availability. During their final meetings the groups identified representatives to present their recommendations in the provincial plenary workshop. The CIET team worked with these representatives to help them to prepare group presentations and to get ready for making the presentations.

**Provincial plenary workshops to feedback and discuss policy recommendations**

To consolidate the workshopping process in each province, and to present the recommendations from the working groups for policy level feedback and endorsement, a plenary workshop was organized in each province:

These workshops were attended by policy makers, government officials, provincial and local government public representatives (Members of Provincial Assemblies (MPAs) and councillors), provincial level NGOs working for women development, civil society, and media representatives. Representatives from the four working groups presented their groups’ recommendations as consolidated during the workshopping process, making reference to the social audit evidence. The workshop participants provided useful feedback to fine tune and finalize the recommendations. The presence of key policy makers in the workshops helped in generating policy level commitment and endorsement for the process as well as the recommendations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Plenary workshops were held in each province:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punjab: 11 June 2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh: 22 June 2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan: 24 June 2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWFP: 26 June 2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations of the working groups

Economic and employment factors

The evidence base

Analysis of the social audit findings indicated that better economic status of the household reduced a woman’s risk of being abused (Table 1). This accords with the widely held belief, voiced in the focus groups and by key informants, that poverty is an important reason for women being abused. However, it is clear that better economic status does not guarantee that a woman will not be abused and abuse was certainly not confined to the poorest households in the survey. There are many other factors that put a woman at risk of abuse. The situation for working women is not necessarily better than that for women who do not work (Table 39). Indeed, women with employment outside the home or with an income were not found to be protected against the experience of abuse in the home and in addition they faced an increased risk of harassment outside the home: in the general environment and in the workplace specifically. Women with employment or an income were, however, more likely to tell someone if they did experience abuse, perhaps reflecting their greater assertiveness. Thus economic empowerment of women needs to be seen as part of an overall effort which also includes improving education for women and men and raising awareness of other family members about the contribution a working woman makes to the whole household.

The working groups in the four provinces used this evidence to develop action plans and policy recommendations in the economic and employment sector to help reduce abuse against women.

Improve the workplace environment for women

All provinces

- All organizations should ensure availability of adequate and culturally appropriate physical facilities for women employees such as separate toilets, common rooms and place for prayers.
- For mothers of young children either day care facilities should be provided or there should be some flexibility in their working hours. There should be no compulsion for them to work overtime.
• Employers should make their employees aware of their rights, of rules and regulations, and of reporting channels in case of abuse or violation of their rights.

NWFP
• Females at work should dress modestly (purdah).

Punjab
• Employers should provide complaints boxes for employees in work places.
• Employers should display workplace rules and regulations prominently in the workplace.
• Female councillors should visit work places within their area to ensure the safety of female workers.

Balochistan
• Information on workplace ethics and working women’s rights should be disseminated through the media and street theatre.
• Employers should train new employees about workplace ethics.
• Improve legislation on abuse against women, especially on sexual harassment at the workplace.

Reduce the risk of harassment of women outside the household

The groups in all the provinces agreed that tackling harassment of women in the general environment requires measures to increase public respect for women’s status and their rights. Also, although all types of harassment are punishable crimes, women are mostly unaware of this and have important disincentives to reporting harassment. The groups’ recommendations included:
• Use the mass media to raise public awareness about harassment of women in public places.
• Disseminate messages through community meetings, seminars and street theatres. Provide training for councillors and local NGOs to take the lead in this.

Sindh
• Establish women reporting cells in each district. This will require development of legislation and support from line departments, such as the home department (covering the police).
• Publicise women’s rights and contact details of reporting centres through posters in public places.
• Train journalists at district, provincial and national level to highlight the issue of harassment of women.
• Initiate a separate TV channel to carry information on women’s issues, including the problem of harassment.
• Enforce the rules about women’s seats in public transport. If the rules are broken, punish the transport
owner, driver or conductor and the men who occupy the women’s seats or stand in the women’s compartment.

**NWFP**
- Females should dress modestly (purdah).
- Improve transport facilities for women. If possible provide separate transport for women.
- Provide job opportunities for unemployed males so that they are not hanging around the streets.
- Provide local employment opportunities for women to reduce their need to travel long distances to work.

**Punjab**
- Provide self-defence training for women.

**Protect women with an income from abuse at home**

The fact that women with employment outside the home had the same or even an increased risk of abuse in the home compared with non-working women was not a surprise to the working groups in the provinces. They attributed this to the expectations of the family, who expect a working woman to be able also to complete all her household work without any concession. If she fails to fulfill all her household duties she may be subjected to abuse. Her character may also be called into question because she goes out to work. There is a need to change attitudes in the family and in the community about the role of working women, creating an appreciation of the double burden that working women have to bear and of their contribution to the household economy. There should be a more positive projection of working women. The groups recommended Pesh Imams, councillors, NGOs and the mass media as change agents. Their specific recommendations included:
- Promote positive messages about working women locally through community meetings, seminars and street theatres. Train local councillors and NGOs for this task.
- Use the mass media to promote a positive image of working women and their contribution.

**Sindh**
- Involve Pesh Imams, who can speak on this topic in their Friday sermons
- Improve literacy and formal education so that people can better understand women’s changing role.

**NWFP**
- Women should open their own bank accounts so their pay can be deposited directly into their own account.
- Encourage women with a monthly income to invest some of it in insurance.
- Develop saving schemes for employed women.
Balochistan

- Raise women’s status by ensuring their share in property and income in accordance with religious teachings and legal and constitutional rights.
- Advocate among family elders that women should be allowed to decide how to spend their income.
- Provide confidence building for women to demand their rights to decide about their own income.

Develop economic opportunities especially for women

The main focus of the recommendations was the promotion and support of small and medium enterprises, including home based enterprises. The recommendations included:

- Existing units that provide financial and technical support to families should set-up micro-credit schemes and follow-up units. They should also provide information for people setting up SMEs, and provide basic training in management and marketing.
- Provide follow-up support for SMEs. Establish coordination committees with membership from local employers and NGOs.
- Improve credit and other financial assistance for SMEs, such as rotating grants as seed money.
- Form cooperatives or groups rather than giving financial assistance to individuals, to ensure accountability and sustainability.
- Involve the private sector to support skill development centres.
- Train male family members in marketing to involve them in the business and avoid the middle man.
- Develop favourable loan terms and conditions and tax relief for women, and some follow-up support from loan providers to ensure sustainability.
- Improve the distribution of funds from Baitul-Mal and Zakat fund and link to skills development to support SMEs.
- Run promotional activities for SMEs such as exhibitions and seminars: at district level to share knowledge and at provincial level to develop new markets.

Sindh

- Establish district resource centres to support SMEs.
- Develop a directory of district specific feasible products and technologies and make this available to SMEs and training centres.
- Develop a database of all SMEs in each district.

NWFP
• Establish collective marketing facilities where women can display their products and get a reasonable return without interference of a middleman.

_Punjab_
• Introduce vocational training and skills development training in formal schools. This could also encourage parents to send their children to school.
• Develop guidelines and possibly legislation to encourage institutions to employ women.

_Balochistan_
• Promulgate and implement legislation on employment opportunities for women.
• Create job opportunities for both men and women to improve the overall economic status of households.

**Educational factors**

Table 2 summarises the educational factors that were linked to a reduced risk of a woman experiencing abuse. Education of both the woman and her husband was protective. Also, a woman who experienced abuse was more likely to tell someone about it if she had some formal education.

Perceptions about the importance of female education were also relevant as an indicator of gender attitudes, and women from households that were in favour of girl’s education had less risk of being abused. Qualitative evidence from focus groups and key informants also stressed the importance of better education and increased awareness of both men and women for reducing abuse against women and improving reporting of abuse. The provincial working groups on educational factors considered this evidence, as well as information about present policies and their implementation in the province, in order to formulate their recommendations. The recommendations were about increasing the quantity and quality of education for both males and females; increasing girls’ enrolment and retention; and reviewing the curriculum to ensure it deals adequately with gender and human rights issues.

**Improve existing education infrastructure**

The recommendations covered the problem of closed and non functioning schools as well as the need for new facilities. The main recommendations included:
• Involve communities in the establishment schools, through Citizen Community Boards (CCBs), local voluntary groups, CBOs and NGOs.
• Establish new schools where needed. The idea of mosque schools could be revived to reduce the cost of establishing new schools.

*Sindh*
• Donors should work in coordination with the education department to ensure funds are best used in accordance with the real needs.
• Handover closed and non-functioning schools to willing communities and NGOs after a careful review of their capacities to run them.

*Punjab*
• Ensure a uniform education policy for the private and public sectors.

*Balochistan*
• Involve elected district government representatives to make needs assessments for educational facilities.

**Improve school management and monitoring**

• Involve influential people in the communities, such as Pesh Imams, community leaders and councillors, in school management committees (SMCs).
• Union councillors through UC monitoring committees should monitor the schools in their areas.
• Involve communities in the management of schools through Citizen Community Boards (CCBs), local voluntary groups, CBOs, and NGOs.
• Provide logistic support for the field staff in the education department, including transport for conducting monitoring visits to schools.

**Promote girls’ education**

The recommendations for promoting girls’ education included:
• Raise awareness of the public, particularly parents, about the importance of girls’ education. The Pesh Imams could talk about this in Friday sermons (note the present evidence that households are not always aware of the local Pesh Imam’s support for girls’ formal education).
• Provide basic facilities such as toilets, drinking water, boundary walls and chowkidars in all girls’ schools.
• Continue and expand special incentives to promote girl’s enrolment and retention in school, such as no uniform or free uniform policy at primary level, free text books (arriving on time), free cooking oil and lunch in all girls’ schools, free education for girls up to 10th grade and scholarships for deserving girls for higher education.
**Punjab**
- Pesh Imams should use quotes from religious texts to promote girls’ education. Provide training for Pesh Imams about the importance of girls’ education and check if they then include the issue in their sermons.
- Pesh Imams and community leaders should speak together to promote girls’ education, for example at educational festivals and conferences.
- Role models should visit schools to encourage young students, especially girls, to continue education.

**Balochistan**
- Introduce career counselling into the school timetable, especially for girls, to encourage them to continue their education up to a higher level and then to go on to find work.

**Sindh**
- Involve communities in choosing the site of new girls’ schools, so they feel comfortable to send their girls to these schools.

**NWFP**
- Make education compulsory for women. Education, at least at the primary level, should be seen as a basic human right for both women and men.
- Make the timing of girls’ schools more flexible to help girls attend regularly.

**Increase availability of female teachers**

The groups considered non-availability of teachers, especially female teachers, and their uneven distribution between schools to be major problems for girls’ education. Recommendations to address this issue included:
- Hire local teachers and involve communities through SMCs to ensure that teachers attend. Give head teachers more authority and responsibility in this regard.
- Provide incentives to teachers posted in remote areas and make secure arrangements for their accommodation.

**Sindh**
- In areas where no female teachers are available, hire trusted retired male teachers from the same community.
- District education departments should redistribute teachers to schools where they are lacking.

**Balochistan**
- Provide transport and accommodation arrangements for female teachers serving outside their home towns.
Curriculum review

There was a consensus among the groups in all provinces that to build a positive attitude among youth towards women, gender awareness, human rights and women’s rights should be built into the curriculum at all levels, including the primary classes. The main recommendations included:

- Include women’s rights and respect for women in the teaching and textbooks on different subjects.
- Make due reference to Islamic teaching about women’s rights from the Quraan and Sunnah.
- Integrate religious and spiritual education with formal education; allocated some time for education on the Quraan and Sunnah in all grades.
- Harmonise the curriculum of private and government schools; education departments should include this in education policies.

Improve teaching practices

The teacher is a role model for students and his or her way of behaving, including on gender issues, helps to shape the students’ character and behaviour. Teachers need better training for this role and better supervision, monitoring and support. The main recommendations included:

- Make teachers’ training more practical, including modern methods for primary education.
- In teachers’ training place more emphasis on professionalism and the ethics of teaching.
- Make monitoring effective and supportive to help and guide teachers, rather than threatening.

Sindh

- Arrange regular refresher courses for teachers at all levels, including gender issues.

Punjab

- Introduce teaching and syllabus in regional languages, especially for primary grades.

Balochistan

- Organize visits and interaction with other institutions relevant to gender issues for both students and teachers.
- Reduce the student-teacher ratio to allow better quality teaching interaction with students.

Non-formal education and literacy

The main recommendations of the groups regarding non-formal education, with a focus on gender issues, included:
• Establish more non-formal schools in communities, including “home schools” at the local teachers’ house, which may be particularly good for girls.
• Link adult literacy and education activities with religious education and skills development.
• Use the mass media and community channels to encourage adults to come forward for literacy training.
• Expand the existing network of Non Formal Education (NFE) as a part of the education for all (EFA) initiative to other areas in all provinces.

Sindh
• Prioritize allocation of adult literacy funds for those areas where there is more need but fewer opportunities.

Balochistan
• Arrange for post primary classes as part of evening schooling in government and private schools.
• Involve elected representatives in setting up adult literacy centres.
• Award scholarships to encourage adult literacy.
• Promote distance learning initiatives.
• Officials in the education system should promote regular and open interaction between teachers and principals.

NWFP
• Use government schools for non-formal education in the evenings.

Vocational training and skills development

The groups in all the provinces noted that basic formal education presently does little to help students to earn a living afterwards, missing an opportunity to improve economic conditions, also linked to the risk of abuse against women. They recommended linking formal and non-formal education with vocation training and skills building. Some specific recommendation included:
• Introduce marketing training for women and men as a part of vocational training.
• Link literacy and vocational training with schemes to develop market opportunities and credit facilities through public and private sector coordination.

Table 3. Socio-cultural attitudes and practices related to reduced risk of abuse:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A woman is less likely to experience abuse if:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Her marriage was at age 18 or above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Her marriage was with consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Her household has no tradition of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exchange marriage, dowry or bride price</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Her household does not practise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>polygamy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• She does not think that a man hitting a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>woman can be justified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The senior woman or man in her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>household dose not think a man hitting a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>woman can be justified</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Socio-cultural attitudes and practices

The socio-cultural practices, family traditions and attitudes that the findings indicated to be related to a reduced risk of abuse against women are summarised in Table 3. Early age of marriage and marriage without consent were associated with an increased risk of a woman experiencing abuse.
Also traditional practices of exchange marriage, dowry and bride price carried an increased risk for abuse of women in the household, as did a tradition of polygamy in the household. The attitude that hitting a woman could be justified, more commonly held by women than by men, was also associated with an increased risk of abuse of women.

The groups in all the provinces considering these issues appreciated that changing attitudes and traditional practices will require long term strategies and consistent and continuing efforts. Nevertheless, they believed that a start could be made and some aspects could be more amenable to change. The main recommendations of the groups are summarised below.

**Age of marriage and woman’s consent for marriage**

The working groups noted that there is existing legislation about age of marriage and consent for marriage, but there are problems with enforcement. For example, many marriages are solemnized not by the Nikah registrars themselves, but by the local Pesh Imam or a family elder acting as ‘Nikah Khawan’, with the marriage subsequently reported to the registrar for registration. Thus the registrars cannot check if the marriage complies with the laws before registering it. Most of the Nikah Registrars themselves are not aware of the legal provisions and their responsibilities. There are no criteria for appointment of Nikah Registrars and to ensure they understand their role and responsibilities.

The main recommendations of the groups included:

- Provide training about the legal requirements for marriage, for the Nikah Khawan, Pesh Imams and councillors.
- Union councillors should check for irregularities in marriage registrations in their area.
- Union Councils should issue licences for Nikah Registrars only to persons fully aware of the relevant laws. Union Nazims should cancel licences on report of any violation of the laws.
- Raise public awareness about the disadvantages of early marriage, for health, religious and social reasons, and publicise the laws about marriage. Pesh Imams should include this issue in Friday sermons.
- Include information about family laws in the curriculum of formal and non-formal education.
- Review and update as necessary the existing family laws through a review committee or commission.
**Punjab**
- District, tehsil and union governments should ensure implementation of the existing laws.

**Sindh**
- Develop a database at UC level to record marriages and divorces as events like births and deaths.
- Promulgate a Local Government ordinance to authorize the Union Council for Nikah registration

**Balochistan**
- Health workers such as doctors, lady health visitors (LHVs) and lady health visitors (LHWs) should highlight the health disadvantages of early marriages.
- Incorporate religious teachings about marriage into the curriculum of Madarsahs and formal schools.

**Tradition of exchange marriages, bride price and dowry**

The groups recognized that these traditions are deep rooted in the culture in almost all parts of the country and will be difficult to change. Their main recommendations included:
- Raise public awareness of the disadvantages of these practices, for example through community meetings led by union councillors, through Friday sermons from the Pesh Imams, and through the mass media.
- Promote government policy of only one dish in wedding meals to eliminate an excuse for demanding dowry.

The working groups considered the use of exchange marriages for settling family and tribal disputes, with such decisions made by local Jirgas. This practice is a crime under the penal Code. In Sindh, for example, the Chief Justice of the High Court has said that such decisions taken by the Jirgas are punishable. The groups’ recommendations for curbing exchange marriages included:
- Motivate Jirga members not to give a verdict of exchange marriage to settle tribal and local disputes.
- Promulgate additional laws to prevent exchange marriages, especially those used to settle tribal disputes.

**Polygamy**

There are clear legal provisions about polygamy. It requires permission from the Arbitration Council consisting of the Chairman (Nazim) of the Union council, one representative of the wife and one of the husband. There are weaknesses in the law and its enforcement. The recommendations of the groups about polygamy included:
• Polygamous marriages should be subject to permission of the Family Court and criteria for granting permission should be strictly followed.
• The Family Court should grant the existing wife or wives adequate provisions for maintaining their own residence and ensure that their financial status is not affected by the additional marriage.
• The husband wishing for another marriage should delegate his right of divorce to his existing wife or wives.
• The husband should pay a dower to the existing wife or wives, with the amount based on financial status.
• Further laws in accordance with Islamic teaching should be promulgated and enforced to discourage polygamy.

Perceptions about justification for hitting a woman

More than half the women interviewed believed that a man hitting a woman could be justified, even though they almost all thought that hitting a woman was a form of abuse. The focus groups confirmed the widespread view that hitting a woman could be justified. They also offered some pointers for how to convince people that hitting women was not justifiable. The main recommendations of the groups about how to change the perception about justification for hitting a woman included:
• Undertake advocacy campaigns about the issue, particularly targeting women, with the help of Pesh Imams, union councillors and NGOs at the local level, and through the mass media.
• Include messages about why hitting women is not justifiable in the curriculum of formal and non-formal education.
• Strengthen and promulgate legislation against beating of women by their husbands or other family members.

Reporting abuse

The findings from the social audit indicated that only a minority of women who had experienced abuse had told anyone about it, even someone in the family. The factors that were associated with an increased likelihood of a woman telling someone about abuse she had experienced are summarised in Table 4. In almost all cases the person a woman told about her experience of abuse was someone in the family and the numbers who reported the abuse outside the household were negligible. Quantitative analysis of the factors related to reporting outside the household was not possible but the focus groups and key informant interviews
provided valuable insights into why women do not report abuse and what could help them to report. The main reasons given for women not reporting abuse were the associated dishonour of the woman and the family, the fear of the consequences of reporting, and the perception that it would do no good. Better education and awareness were seen as key to increasing reporting of abuse, as well as providing better local facilities for reporting. The groups considered this evidence and made recommendations for how to encourage women to report and provide help for them when they did report.

**Increase social acceptability of women reporting abuse**

The groups recognized the problem of the stigma attached to a woman reporting abuse. Unless this is removed, women will continue to be reluctant to report. The public perception of a woman who reports abuse needs to be changed. At the same time, there is a need to make women aware of their legal rights and to encourage them to report. The groups’ recommendations included:

- Run an advocacy campaign to change negative perceptions of reporting abuse. Target women, men and family elders. Involve community leaders, Pesh Imams and especially women councillors as change agents.
- Train women councillors for an advocacy role to change perceptions about reporting abuse.
- Involve the mass media to portray positive images of women who report abuse and avoid negative images.
- Train media representatives to report constructively and effectively issues of abuse and violence against women.

**Sindh**

- Train elected representatives about abuse and reporting abuse, as people contact them based on their political affiliation.
- Display short slogans on hoardings etc to encourage women to report abuse.

**Balochistan**

- Promulgate provincial policies and any necessary legislation to improve reporting of abuse.
- Implement the NPA with zeal and true spirit.

**Punjab**

- Include abuse and reporting abuse as topics in the curriculum of both formal and non-formal education.
- Review and improve legislation to encourage abused women report and to safeguard their rights.
**NWFP**

- Introduce teaching of the Holy Quran and Sunnah, especially verses relating to rights and status of women, as a compulsory part of the curriculum at all levels of formal education.
- Introduce short compulsory “Dars” from religious scholars at all levels of formal education.
- Review the curriculum of Madarsahs to make them more effective, scientific and practical in the true spirit of Islam. Include students of Madarsahs in social activities.

**Strengthen existing institutions for reporting abuse**

Health services, police and judiciary services should help women to report abuse and provide support for abused women. However, it was clear from the discussions in focus groups and with key informants, as well as the interviews with individual women, that women are loathe to use these services. Apart from a general reluctance to report to anyone, the experience of reporting to these services is often negative, and women report a bad attitude of the service providers. The groups’ recommendations for improving these services included:

**Health services**

- All health facilities, including primary care facilities, should be able to see abused women and refer as necessary to tertiary facilities, Musalihati Anjuman or Union Nazims.
- Train Lady Health Workers (LHWs) to provide first aid and counselling for abused women they may encounter in their routine household visits.

**Punjab**

- Training of health care providers to deal with potential abuse cases. Provide incentives to those who help abused women to report.
- Provide counselling and financial support in the health facility for abused women who report.

**Police**

- Recruit police officers on merit and with a minimum educational requirement of graduate.
- Improve pay scales and introduce positive incentives for police officers to prevent corruption.
- Allocate of resources for basic administrative and logistic support to the police force.
- Recruit women staff at each police station. Provide adequate security and professional respect for these women police officers.
Balochistan
- Create more women police stations especially in rural areas, with suitable facilities.

Punjab
- Provide gender awareness training for police.
- Simplify the language of the FIR so that people can understand what has been recorded.
- Set up referral links from the police to counselling and legal aid support for abused women.
- Establish an effective complaints system in case women are not treated well by the police.

Judiciary
- Increase the number of female judges and prosecutors.
- For all cases of abuse against women the judge and the prosecutor should be female.
- Camera proceedings for women abuse cases to prevent unwanted publicity and embarrassment.
- Develop a code of conduct for abuse cases; judges should ensure this is followed by the lawyers and stop them using insulting language and undue probing.
- Establish speedy trial courts to hear abuse cases.
- Provide free legal aid for needy women

Punjab
- Provide special training for lawyers and judges who deal with abuse cases.

NWFP
- Provide special advocates in police stations to help women bring their cases to court.

Develop new institutional arrangements to help women report abuse

The focus groups suggested that some sort of local committee could help women to report abuse. The working groups discussed how to set up a local, accessible, and trusted system for reporting abuse with good referral links and institutional support. They identified the new local government arrangements, including the presence of women councillors, as a starting point for such a system. They noted that the Musalihati Anjuman (reconciliation committees) envisaged in each union council could be the first place for women to report abuse. Cases could either be resolved in this forum or referred on as necessary. The groups’ recommendations included:
- Women councillors should be proactive in identifying abuse cases and encouraging women to report, through regular contacts with women in their communities.
• Establish and strengthen *Musalihati Anjuman* in each union council; include women councillors as members.
• Develop referral links from *Musalihati Anjuman* to women reporting cells, police, judiciary, health facilities and legal aid organizations.
• Musalihati Anjuman should maintain records of abuse cases that they deal with.
• Establish and publicise a women reporting cell in each district to link with the *Musalihati Anjuman*.
• Establish referral links from women reporting cell to the police, judiciary, legal and social support organizations.
• Establish shelter homes, including social and economic rehabilitation support, for abused women who cannot go home once they have reported abuse.

*Sindh*

• All union councils should construct a community hall at an accessible place where women can gather.
• Establish a 24 hour abuse help line to provide information and counselling support.

*Punjab*

• Train members of *Musalihati Anjuman* and union councillors about gender and abuse.
• Set up links between Musalihati Anjuman and district public safety commissions.

*NWFP*

• Establish CCBs with female participation to encourage and support women to report abuse.
Minutes of provincial plenary workshops
**Punjab plenary workshop**

Plenary workshop to feed back policy recommendations arising from findings of social audit on abuse against women

11th June 22, 2004, Lahore

The workshop started with the recitation of the holy Qu’ran. Then Ms. Noureen Naqvi, deputy secretary of Women Development, Punjab, welcomed the chief guest and guest of honor and gave the background of the SAAAW process in Punjab. She is SAAAW focal point in Punjab, and on that day she also acted as an anchorperson.

The meeting was attended by the female provincial legislators, two provincial ministers, two women councillors, NGO representatives, government officials and several representatives of the local and provincial media.

Ms. Naqvi explained that the SAAAW process started in 2001 and that Women Development Department Punjab had been an active partner in the activities. She also mentioned that WDD personnel participated in the pre-testing and the fieldwork in Punjab. The WDD department helped in the workshopping process. She thanked the participants for the attending the event and then invited Dr. Anne Cockcroft to give a presentation on the objectives and the scope of the SAAAW project, and some relevant findings.

Representatives of the four working groups presented the policy recommendations from each group. Ms. Sofia Shaheeda presented the recommendations from the economic and employment working group. Mr. Ghulam Abbas Saganna, additional secretary literacy, presented on behalf of the education working group. Mr. Muhammad Assad, from Al-Qalam society, presented the recommendations of the working group on socio-cultural factors. Ms. Azra Parvez, union councillor from Lahore City, presented the recommendations of the group on reporting of abuse.

UNDP senior gender advisor Ms. Socorro Reyes said that this is a global problem, and so is the failure to address it effectively through the formal criminal justice system. Very few cases of physical aggression, sexual abuse and harassment were reported, fewer still reached the courts and much fewer ended in convictions. This is because the victims rarely used the formal mechanisms of police and courts for seeking justice, because of high cost and delay by police and judicial authorities.
She said that UNDP proposed support for alternative dispute resolution mechanisms, like the reconciliation committees and community supported mechanisms. She said that a study in Pakistan revealed that almost two thirds of women had experienced some kind of abuse but only very few cases has been reported to the police. She said that problems of under-reporting in Pakistan are also due to the high cost of litigation, cultural barriers and lack of confidence in the existing system. She supported dispute resolution through reconciliation committees set up by Insaf committees formed under the new local government system. She further said that informal Jirga systems had not worked in favor of women, and a number of incidents show that culprits get cleared of charges with the help of influential people in the Jirga. The Sindh high court has banned all jirga trials.

Question and answer session

In the question and answer session, participants took interest in different issues and also gave some comments.

- One participant commented on a policy initiative presented by education groups, to contend that the scheme of giving some amount to poor students is not effective. The monthly input is very high but the output is not very good.

Members of the education group said that in different areas of Punjab, like southern Punjab, it is necessary to give incentives to those who are daily wage earners. “We are not spoon-feeding them, but providing some incentives to those parents who don’t send their children to school. It’s not that we are going to attack their self-respect”, commented a member of the group.

- One participant asked about the research methodology and wanted to know about the relationship factors and policy recommendations in more detail.

- One participant wanted to know the percentage of females who are involved in curriculum design.

Mr. Sargana (Additional secretary Literacy Department), representing the education group, said that the head of the curriculum committee is a female. There are also female members in curriculum committees.

One MPA said that is essential to involve parliamentarians in activities such as this so that they can know the process, especially when there is a need to enact legislation and coordinate with government. Ms. Naqvi said that members of parliament are now involved in district core groups, indicating the government interest to engage them.

Another MPA said that government does not engage female members of parliament. She demanded female representation in the process. She also expressed her appreciation for the policy recommendations, as they show the deep involvement of different people in the sensitive issue of abuse against women. She also said that awareness should be created among males, so that the risk of abuse can be reduced. She requested training for males to give them awareness on such issues, and she offered help to engage men from the communities.
One participant said that there is a need to educate councillors. Councillors must be F.A and Nazims must be B.A. He also pointed to difficulties in communication about developmental issues when visiting rural communities.

One participant said that there must be improvement in the community environment so that women can work freely. She said there is much work to be done on this at the grassroots level.

Another participant asked about the income of working women in Balochistan. Dr. Cockcroft explained that females in Balochistan are not often working outside their homes but they are earning income for the household through work undertaken within the homestead.

One participant also wanted to add one recommendation that media can promote education through the cartoons also.

One participant agreed on the recommendation of culture group that the process of payment to the existing wife or wives in case of a second or subsequent marriage should be clear and well defined.

It was also noted that since Musalihati Anjuman members are coming from the community, including the common people, how one can expect them to understand the issues. They need training. Until and unless females are economically empowered, they can’t do anything.

Dr. Socorro Reyes (UNDP senior gender advisor) said that we are looking for some mechanism that can mobilize the females. If they can’t go to government departments, then there should be some institution where they can go to with their problems. One alternative would be to put life into Musalihati Anjuman.

One woman Councillor stressed the need to activate the MA’s and to set up women’s centres. There is a Muslim family law related to second marriage but it’s not implemented. Female councillors can play active role in MA’s. “We should come out of the war of male and female and work together”, she said.

One participant said that any national campaign should be about human rights instead of just women’s rights. One lawyer said that the main problem is that women are not participating in decision-making. Until and unless we have women’s participation in the private sector we cannot promote their involvement in decision making.

**Speech of chief guest**

The provincial minister for women development and human rights, Punjab, Ms. Ashfia Riaz Fittana delivered her speech. She said that the process of data collection started in 2001. At the time assemblies and female MPAs were not in place. She said women should get their rights by promoting understanding and awareness and not by confrontation with men. She said that gender discrimination always began at home when even educated mothers discriminated between their sons and daughters. Most parents want a son because they believe that he will support them financially. This is the reason they do not pay equal attention to the education of their daughters. Ms. Fittana said emancipation of women is necessary for social development of the society, as they comprise the half the population. One
half of the society is dragging the other, which is incapacitated due to lack of awareness of economic realities.

She highlighted the role of local government and emphasized that there should be mechanisms to provide an enabling environment for women to report abuse and seek justice. The minister stressed the need for involving opinion leaders and religious scholars for the attitude change of the public about abuse against women. She said that the rights of women are protected in the holy Qu’ran and as well as in the constitution of Pakistan. There are many laws which are not known by the general public. She gave the example that imprisonment for three months has been prescribed for harassing a woman and six months for slapping her, in an ordinance promulgated in 2002, but very few people know about this.

She invited all stakeholders to support the recommendations presented in this workshop. CIET worked hard with the collaboration of women development department to give these findings and now it is time for action, including legislation. A woman of 18 years has the right to divorce. She can make an application in the family court and the problem will be solved. The problem is this that women are not fully aware of these laws. Women are human beings and they should be treated on an equal basis with men. Instead, they are being treated as the diseased (cancer) part of this society. Women love their sons more than daughters as they know that in future they are going to provide their financial support. Daughters should be strong economically so that they can become the arms of their mothers.

She said that religion gives a woman protection in every way. An educated woman should treat her son and daughter equally, as the girl is also an important part of the society. Women in every role -mother, daughter or sister- should be given importance. Until males support and cooperate with females the situation of females cannot be improved.

Concluding remarks

Mr. Saeed Ahmad Khan (Secretary SWWD and BM, Punjab) made the concluding remarks. He said poverty is the basic issue and the most marginalized group are the females. “We have to tackle this issue realistically. In our country, the rate of domestic violence is high. Many women face domestic violence but they don’t report it”, he pointed out. Because of this domestic violence many women develop psychological problems. He mentioned that only 3.5 % women are employed in private sector.

For the protection of working women it is not enough to add more legal punishments; what is needed is implementation of existing laws. Judicial reforms are very important for justice. He was of the view that ensuring conviction and punishment of culprits is more important for
discouraging violence against women then the enhancement of punishments. He mentioned
the Gender Reform Action Plan, which aims to bring women into the private sector and into
the government sector. He also talked about the Pakistan Family Protection Project. In the
end he thanked all members of provincial assembly and other participants for attending the
workshop, and also CIET for this effort. “We know the severity of problems and these
recommendations are food for thought for us”, he concluded.

Vote of thanks

In the end, Ms Naqvi thanked all the participants. She asked participants to “please go back to
your work places with a thought of the day to bring about change in attitudes about abuse
against women”.
### Plenary Workshop to feedback policy recommendations arising from findings of the Social Audit of Abuse Against Women (SAAAW)

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS OF PUNJAB PLENARY WORKSHOP**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.NO</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>DESIGNATION/DEPTT</th>
<th>CONTACT: NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ms. Naureen Naqvi</td>
<td>Deputy Secretary Mowd</td>
<td>042-9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ms. Asifa Mumtaz</td>
<td>Hostel Warden Family Welfare Coop Society.</td>
<td>7244061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr. Athar Rasool</td>
<td>Radio Pakistan Lahore Station</td>
<td>9200674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mohammad Saleem</td>
<td>Participant of Saaaw fieldwork</td>
<td>0300/4233147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ms. Shagufta Sarwar</td>
<td>Member City Govern</td>
<td>7313585</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ms. Asifa Mumtaz</td>
<td>Hostel Warden Family Welfare Coop Society.</td>
<td>7244061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Ms. Durre Shahwar</td>
<td>M.P.A.</td>
<td>5700132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Ms. Suraiya Nureen</td>
<td>CPDA</td>
<td>54256248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ms. Azra Parvez</td>
<td>Councilor Of U.C.94</td>
<td>7577479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ms. Razia Begum</td>
<td>S.W.S.Ghulla Wattowan</td>
<td>0493/812441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Ms. Bushra Begum</td>
<td>S.W.S. Ghulla Walla Wattowan</td>
<td>033/3430/7972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Ms. Shaheen Attiqr</td>
<td>Buynad</td>
<td>0496/731455,731393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Mr. Ghulam Abbas</td>
<td>Add.Secretary(Literacy Deptt.)</td>
<td>9203360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Mr. Saeed Ahmad Khan</td>
<td>Secretary Social Welfare Deptt.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Ms. Anilla G. Gill</td>
<td>St. Coordinator</td>
<td>S.P.O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Ms. Kausar Zehra</td>
<td>Project Coordinator</td>
<td>SWD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Mr. Ijaz Ahmad</td>
<td>Daily Aftab</td>
<td>0320/4631237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Ms. Bushra Naheed</td>
<td>Assistant Professor Social Work Deptt:</td>
<td>0300/4303368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Ms. Aniqa Farwa</td>
<td>Lecturer</td>
<td>042/5869939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Mr. Asad Ullah Khan</td>
<td>Al-Qalam</td>
<td>0300/4110529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Sufia Shahida</td>
<td>Statistical Office</td>
<td>0300/4127872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Mr. Mubasher Javaid</td>
<td>Medical Social Officer Govt: Hospital Kot Khangah Saeed Lahore</td>
<td>6845144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Mr. Sultan</td>
<td>P.C.to Minister W.D</td>
<td>7583776©</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Ms. Azra Yonus</td>
<td>Coordinator Al-Qalam Educational Welfare Society Moghalpura</td>
<td>0303/6414549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Ms. Naheed Samad</td>
<td>PRO</td>
<td>5750231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Ms. Maha Raja</td>
<td>M.P.A</td>
<td>03337215133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Ms. Bushra Qamar</td>
<td>Sanatzaar(NGO)</td>
<td>7820886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Ms. Nighat Ara</td>
<td>Member District councilor LHR.</td>
<td>0426547278/0300-4121284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Phone Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Ms. Gaity Ara</td>
<td>Reporter Geo TV</td>
<td>6309468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Mr. Zahoor-ul-Haq</td>
<td>Reporter Daily Express</td>
<td>0300-4201579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Mr. Anjum Hafeez</td>
<td>Personal Assistant</td>
<td>0300-9434208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Mr. Mubashir Jhandad</td>
<td>Coordinator of literate Pakistan</td>
<td>5164737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Syed Maqsood</td>
<td>Literate Pakistan</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Ms. Wajahat Batool</td>
<td>YCHR (NGO)</td>
<td>6666404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Ms. Shazia Khan</td>
<td>Exe. Director YCHR</td>
<td>6666404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Mr. Tahir Khan</td>
<td>Teacher of Hameeda Begum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Educational welfare society</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Ms. Ayesha Shareef</td>
<td></td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Syed Abid Sherazi</td>
<td>Geo PTV News Camera Men</td>
<td>7470711/0300-4243096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Rahat Mehfooz</td>
<td>DGPR</td>
<td>0300-4320844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Amir</td>
<td>Camera man DGPR</td>
<td>9201361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Mr. Shabeer</td>
<td>Light man DGPR</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Mr. Riaz</td>
<td>DGPR</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Ms. Roahi Shoaib</td>
<td>Program coordinator GSP/UNDP</td>
<td>051-2650857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Dr. Socorro</td>
<td>UNDP senior advisor</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Ms. Affifa Khaliq</td>
<td>Program Coordinator (CCHD)</td>
<td>5889666</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Ms. Shaheena Asad</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>7512026/03009414001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Arshad Safdar</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>5168773</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Ms. Shehla Rathor</td>
<td>PS SW</td>
<td>0300-4320336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Ms. Shazia Siraj</td>
<td>Program Officer Eden Developers</td>
<td>5300109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Ms. Farzana Fazal</td>
<td>NPA/CEDAW unit PB</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>Ms. Fiaza Ashafaq</td>
<td>//</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>Dr. Samia Amoad</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>9200590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Jhon Micheal</td>
<td>Spark (NGO)</td>
<td>7562083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Ms. Shahida</td>
<td>//</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>Ms. Samia Ijaz</td>
<td>Lady Reporter Leader</td>
<td>0333-4328991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Ms. Roobi Arif</td>
<td>Lady reporter Daily Khbrain</td>
<td>6309115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>Mr. Naveed Akhtar</td>
<td>Participant of saaaw fieldwork</td>
<td>0303-6454559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>Ms. Siama Shehzadi</td>
<td>NPA/CEDAW</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>Ms. Ayesha Ehsan</td>
<td>General Secretary Rank</td>
<td>0300-8417986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>Malia Aslam</td>
<td>NPA/CEDAW</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>Ms. Niaa Arooj</td>
<td>//</td>
<td>//</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>Ms. Kausar Shamsi</td>
<td>Photographer Din</td>
<td>5883540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>Ms. Farzana Mumtaz</td>
<td>Aurat Foundation</td>
<td>6306534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>Mr. Saqib Salim Butt</td>
<td>Staff Reporter NNI</td>
<td>0300-4446759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Contact Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>Moh. Asghar</td>
<td>Dawn</td>
<td>5758120-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>Ms. Shabnam Aslam</td>
<td>General Councilor</td>
<td>7842221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>Ms. Shamsa Ali</td>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>0300-9468006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>Rana Mubeen</td>
<td>Coordinator L.P.</td>
<td>5164732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>Ms. Nusrat Hashmi</td>
<td>District Councilor</td>
<td>5162062/7353063/03004324512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Ms. Maryam Tahir</td>
<td>NPA unit</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Mr. Omer Sharif</td>
<td>Roznama Pakistan</td>
<td>0320-4613096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Mr. Qurashi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6367551</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>Ms. Fakhira Tehreem</td>
<td>Daily Jang</td>
<td>0320-4657571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>Mr. Shehzad Tabassum</td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Mr. Waseem Shehzad</td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>9201202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>Ms. Misbah Kokab</td>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>0333-4213771</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>Ms. Nargis Bano</td>
<td>District Member</td>
<td>0300-9468006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>Dr. Anne Cockcroft</td>
<td>Country director CIET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>Mr. Ubaidullah Ch.</td>
<td>Provincial Coordinator CIET</td>
<td>0303-6434247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>Ms. Aliya Farooqi</td>
<td>CIET</td>
<td>03204601103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sindh plenary workshop

Minutes of the plenary workshop, Karachi 22 June 2004

The workshop was held on 22 June 2004 at a local hotel. Ms. Mehtab Akbar Rashdi, Secretary Information, Government of Sindh, inaugurated the workshop, while Mr. Aftab Ahmed Memon, Secretary Women Development, Government of Sindh, chaired the workshop. Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Khero, Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), Government of Sindh, was the chief guest on the occasion.

Workshop proceedings

The workshop began with the recitation from the Holy Book.

Session 1

Welcome to the participants and Objectives of the workshop
Ms. Farzana Saleem, Director, Women Development Department, Government of Sindh, welcomed the participants. She specially thanked the chief guest for the inaugural session Ms. Mehtab Akbar Rashdi, Secretary Information, Government of Sindh, for gracing the occasion with her presence. Briefing the participants about the background of SAAAW and objectives of the workshop, she mentioned that the workshop aimed at receiving and discussing the policy and action recommendations of the working groups that had been convened earlier to deliberate for this purpose. She hoped that the workshop would help to propose strategies for taking forward the recommendations in Sindh and to consider issues to take to the federal level. Highlighting the importance of the social audit, she mentioned that this has provided solid ground in terms of evidence to formulate policies and action based on evidence. For this the Women Development Department thanked the efforts made by CIET to generate quality information. The department has taken lead to ensure that the findings from SAAAW are drawn into feasible actions to improve the situation of women in the province. She hoped that through this workshop the department would be able to build in the support from other important stakeholders, required for implementation of these recommendations.

SAAAW objectives, methods and key findings
Dr. Anne Cockcroft, CIET Country Programme Manager in Pakistan, presented the objectives, methods and key findings from SAAAW. She mentioned that the findings from SAAAW need to be viewed from the point of view of risk and resilience factors for abuse, although it also helped to define the extent and patterns of different types of abuse. She mentioned that the end objective of the whole project is to be able to help government of Pakistan to develop a plan of action to improve situation of women, particularly violation of their rights and abuse against them.

Mentioning about the methods used for SAAAW field work, she described various measures that were incorporated in the design of the field work to generate good quality information and to ensure privacy and confidentiality. She described the representative nature and the size of the sample, to ensure that the findings are statistically significant. The design not only included an analysis into of the quantitative household information, but also qualitative information from the community level, key informants and focus group discussions. She then
described some key indicators depicting the national distribution of different types of abuse against women as reported by the women in the sample with the help of maps. She also presented for each type of abuse the key factors that were associated with that abuse and could play a role in reducing risks for women.

Key note address for the inaugural session
Ms. Mehtab Akbar Rashdi, Secretary Information, Government of Sindh and chief guest for the inaugural session, delivered the keynote address. She started with a reflection that SAAAW is interesting in the sense that this is an effort to compute and quantify the abuse which is not that simple. She lauded the efforts for conducting SAAAW as it has provided an opportunity for women to speak out their problems and the abuse which they encounter. She mentioned that if we go with the survey findings we may conclude that the situation about abuse is not that bad but one has to be careful about the issue of under-reporting.

Commenting on different types of abuse, she highlighted the issue of mental/verbal abuse suffered by women from all walks of life, even in the educated and well off families. She said abuse against women is much more than just an event happening to individual. It is a whole phenomenon that reflects the situation in the family, women’s relationship with husband, children, and other family members such as parents and in-laws. At the same time it also gives us an indication of overall community dynamics and attitudes towards women. She mentioned that although abuse occurs everywhere, it is more a problem for the middle class as in the lower class people are so much overwhelmed by their economic needs that they are not bothered by women reporting and shouting about abuse. On the other hand in upper class women have enough socioeconomic empowerment and awareness that they can tackle with the situation more confidently and in a resilient way. She also mentioned that often men are made responsible for abuse against women. However, we should not always blame them as many times it’s another woman who is behind the act.

Mentioning the underlying factors for abuse against women, she attributed it to multiple factors. There were so many reasons that may lead to women’s abuse such as economic compulsion, lack of employment, socio-cultural practices that are regarded as acceptable such as women not being allowed to go out of their homes, or hitting a women being justified. However, she regarded societal behaviour and attitudes as the root causes. However, she also admitted that these factors are not easy to change and require long term consistent and continuous action. She mentioned that in our society people at the community level do not want to get indulge into household and family disputes and are reluctant to take action. At the policy and implementation level, laws are not strong enough to provide a sense of security to the abused women. Even if there is a law, it is not implemented properly. Hence, no women can take risk to put her life and family at stake. We need to look if the state is a in a position to provide a home like secured shelter to such women who dare to come out and report.

Keeping in view the socio-cultural sensitivity of the issue she emphasized that we need to move carefully forward. But we need to take action. The most important things to do would be to create awareness, give economic empowerment and decision making capacity to the women and improve the social acceptability among masses for a woman who reports on abuse against herself.

She emphasized the participants to the workshop that now that this issue has come into limelight through efforts like social audit, the objective should be not to just put in a beautiful report as a conclusion and just forget, but realistically identify what would help. “We need to
identify the ways that help to negate this notion that women are useless and hence confined to homes”, she said. This also leads to frustrations and conflicts resulting in abuse. For this we need to understand all these factors that would help us to take action and step ahead. Taking action for this cause should be a joint responsibility of the state as well as the society. It requires a sustained continuous response from all of us. We also need to compel our legislators to strengthen our laws and their implementation. We need to take our efforts seriously as we are dealing with human beings and not the machines.

In the end she lauded the efforts made by CIET in conducting the social audit mentioning that this has set a stage where we as women are learning to speak out. Once women start sharing their problems with others, it would encourage other women to do the same and initiate a dialogue to sensitize the society and precipitate action. This could be a simple step such as forming a local committee which women can approach or formulating legislation at the provincial level to curb the abuse and punish those who are the culprits. She hoped that the workshop would result in some useful recommendations that can be picked up by those who can take action and would thus help to improve the situation of women in the province. She thanked the workshop organizers for providing her an opportunity to speak on the occasion.

Vote of thanks to the chief guest
Ms. Farzana Saleem, Director, Women Development Department, Government of Sindh, gave a vote of thanks to Ms. Mehtab Akbar Rashdi, the Secretary Information and Chief Guest to the inauguration session. She mentioned that her valuable words of advice would help the workshop participants to deliberate on this important but sensitive issue carefully and in a realistic way.

Session 2

Introduction to the workshopping process
Ms. Farzana Saleem, Director, Women Development Department, Government of Sindh, started the second session with an explanation about the workshopping process. She specially highlighted the role of women development department in facilitating the process. She mentioned that with this workshopping process women development department has also made an effort to define and streamline its role and to serve as a hub and liaison body to coordinate with other government and civil society stakeholders for taking action.

Working group presentations

Group 1: Socio-cultural practices/traditions
Ms. Nighat Fatima, Town councilor, North Nazimabad Town, City district Government Karachi, presented the relevant findings from the social audit that group focused while formulating their recommendations. She specially highlighted practices in relation to
acceptability for women to go out, perceptions about justification for a man or mother-in-law hitting a woman, and family traditions such as dowry, bride price polygamy and exchange marriages. She then presented the findings from risk analysis to show the relationship of these factors with different types of abuses.

Ms. Sabiha Shah, President Ladies Wing of the Lyari Community Development Project, Karachi presented the group’s recommendations to deal with the factors. The recommendations were categorized into following main areas:

A. Strengthen and implement family laws on marriage:
B. Raise public awareness about marriage rights and laws:
C. Tradition of exchange marriages and their use especially to settle disputes:
D. Perceptions about justification for hitting a woman:

Group 2: Education and literacy
Ms. Yasmeen, Principal APWA Government College for Women, Karimabad, Karachi, highlighted the findings on education particularly of women and its relationship with abuse against women. She described that the social audit again confirms the gender gap that is present in our society as far as education and literacy is concerned. However, it was encouraging to see the positive attitude of community leaders such as Pesh Imams about girls’ education. However, she pointed out that the survey shows that there was a gap between Pesh Imams views and perceptions of families about Pesh Imams’ views on girls’ education. It may therefore be important to bridge this gap which may be a reason why some parents may not be sending their girls to school. She then describes how education of the women, husband and head of the household was linked in the social audit risk analysis for reducing the risk of abuse. She mentioned that not only education of the women as well men was protective but also even the positive trends of community opinion makers such as Pesh Imam towards girls’ education were found protective.

Ms. Hameeda Masood Shah, President Women Welfare Association, Sanghar and advisor to the national Commission for Human Development (NCHD), presented the following recommendations from education working group in the following areas:

A. Improve education infrastructure:
B. Improve school management and monitoring:
C. Promote girls’ education:
D. Curriculum review to promote women’s rights and respect:
E. Increase teachers availability especially female teachers in schools:
F. Improved teaching practices:
G. Non-formal education and literacy:
H. Vocational training and skill development:
I. Review of recent initiatives by Education Department, Government of Sindh:

Group 3: Economic factors
Ms. Salma Waheed Murad, President SEWA (NGO) and member Chamber of Commerce and Industries, presented the findings relating to socio-economic conditions that related to the abuse against women. These findings revealed that women with income and employment had either the same risk of abuse as for women who were housewives or did not have any income. Over and above they were at a higher risk of harassment outside the household. This
indicated the fact that the economic empowerment is not providing the benefit that was expected and there is more that needs to be done in conjunction with economic empowerment. However, a positive aspect that was reflected from the survey was that these women were more likely to confide to someone about abuse.

Ms. Shahida Shams, Deputy Director, Manpower and training department, government of Sindh, presented the group recommendations to ensure that economic improvement results in true benefits to the women. The group recommendations targeted the following broad areas:

A. Improve workplace environment for women:
B. Reducing the risk of harassment for working women outside the household:
C. Protect women with an income from abuse at home:
D. Develop economic opportunities for women:

Group 4: Reporting of abuse by women
Ms. Shakira Zaki, General secretary, Anjuman-e-Mafad-e-Amma (NGO), presented the findings from social audit regarding status of reporting by abused women. Highlighting the gravity of the issue she reported that only a third of the women who are beaten tell about it to someone and almost always it is someone from within the family. The numbers who go out to formally report about abuse against them is negligible. However, the audit identifies that if a women is educated, or is employed, or has her own income, she is more likely to tell someone about abuse. The audit also identified that if the women belongs to an economically less vulnerable household, if the perceptions of the family members such as men and mother-in-law are positive towards women abuse and it is accepted for a man to go out of the house, then this also increases the likelihood that women would tell someone about abuse. The main reasons mentioned by women in community group discussions for not reporting abuse were dishonour, being afraid of consequences, no hope that it would be of any use, and lack of knowledge about a trustworthy place where they can go and report. Formation of a local community structure such as a committee was mentioned as the most common response to the question that what would help women to report about abuse. The audit also highlighted the role of women councilor in providing such support.

The recommendations from the working group were categorized in two main action areas. The one that helps to develop an enabling environment for women to report and the other about improving the role of existing support institutions such as Police and Judiciary.

Ms. Hunaiza Qadir, Town Councilor, Gulberg town, city district government Karachi, presented following recommendations from the group for creating an enabling environment for women to report abuse:

A. Increase social acceptability of women reporting abuse:
B. Develop suitable institutional arrangements to help women report:

Ms. Zeb Advocate, incharge women reporting cell, Karachi presented group recommendations for strengthening the existing support institutions for reporting abuse. The recommendations were in the following areas:

A. Health services:
B. Police:
C. Judiciary:
Summary of recommendations

Ms. Farzana Saleem, Director, WDD, summed up the recommendations providing a contextual framework within which the WDD can take up the lead in following up with some of these recommendations. She mentioned that this workshopping process had also helped the department to define a clear role as a leader and hub to coordinate women development activities in the process. She said that being a relatively new department people are not clear about our role. “With this activity we have set a stage where people can understand how the department can work as a catalyst and facilitator. During the follow-up our role would be beyond simple an implementer. In fact we would provide a ground for those who want to do some activities and coordinate for them. We would serve as a coordinating body and link up with sectoral stakeholders such as government line departments, NGOs and other civil society partners”, she said.

She emphasized that many of the issues that are linked to women abuse are cross cutting and until and unless we adopt an integrated approach we won’t be able to move forward. In this regard several working groups talked about establishing district level setups for different set of activities. But we as department have proposed to establish a district resource centre to improve community outreach and empower specially women. These centres would be called CORE (community outreach and empowerment) centres. These centres would be established in each district. As an initial step these centre would start working as women reporting cell for which provincial government has already given approval and allocated resources. Gradually these would be upgraded to include other services available. The idea is to have a one window operation to facilitate women who have different needs. The type of services that would be integrated into this centre would include:

- Income generation activities
- Skill development and display centre
- Information resource centre
- Women reporting cell
- Legal support for women in need
- Link with CBO and NGO networks in the district and within the province

She hoped that with support from provincial government the department would be able to implement the activity and follow-up on other recommendations made during the workshopping process for SAAAW.

Gender Violence and Alternative Dispute Resolution

Dr. Socorro Reyes, UNDP senior gender advisor gave a brief description of UNDP’s proposed framework for alternate mechanisms to deal with the issue particularly violence against women. She regarded abuse against women as a global problem which the formal judicial system has failed to address more or less everywhere. Thus we see that very few cases of physical aggression, sexual abuse and harassment are reported, fewer still reach the courts and much fewer end in convictions. The victims rarely use the formal mechanisms of police and courts for seeking justice due to high costs involved and time that is consumed due to delays made by police and judicial authorities.

She said that study in Pakistan revealed that almost two third of women had experienced some kind of abuse but only few cases has been reported to the police. She said that problem
of under reporting in Pakistan is also due to high cost of litigation, cultural barriers and having less confidence on the existing system. In such situations people contact local structures such as Jirgas and Punchayat. However, these informal systems have also not worked in the favour of women and number of incident shows that culprit with the help of influencials of the Jirga or punchayat get away with the charges. As an example she quoted s decision by the Sindh high court who banned all Jirga trials due to involvement of their members in “karo kari” killings.

Appreciating these problems, UNDP has recommended support for alternative dispute resolution mechanisms that are supported by the communities. One such example is Musalihati Anjuman (MAs) or Reconciliation committee in the new devolution setup. There are examples where similar community structures tackled the gender violence problem in situations where disadvantaged groups were reluctant to approach the court due to case backlog, complex procedures and high cost of litigation, illiteracy and cultural barriers. She supported the dispute resolution through MAs and Insaaf committees under local government system. However, she emphasized that there is a need to build capacities of these committees through proper training and back them with monitoring and research support so that they can function properly.

Reflections on the proceeding by the Chair

Mr. Aftab Ahmed Memon, Secretary Women Development and Chair of the workshop, giving his reflections placed a word of caution in terms of cultural sensitivity of the issue specially the reporting component. He emphasized that the proposed action should reflect our cultural and religious values in their true spirit. He assured that the provincial government is committed to support any initiative that is directed towards improving women’s situation in Sindh. He specially thanked the Additional Chief Secretary to be present on this occasion and regarded it as a reflection on part of Planning and Development Department, Government of Sindh for their support for women development activities in the province. He said that it’s good to see some solid recommendations coming out of the process which can be taken up at the provincial, district and community level for implementation. The women development department has a commitment to the women in this province and will certainly try to fulfil that. He assured that in his role as the leader of the department he would provide his full policy support for implementing these recommendations.

Address by the chief guest

Mr. Ghulam Sarwar Khero, Additional Chief Secretary Sindh, and the chief guest for the closing session, highlighted the level of commitment and support that was available for women development activities from the provincial Government. He mentioned that Sindh Government has recently launched the Sindh Rural Support Progamme with a sizeable amount of 5 million rupees. He mentioned that a good share of this amount would be spent on empowering women through economic uplift training and education. He reiterated government’s commitment to take up the recommendations by this forum. He said that a mention has already been made of the recent initiatives by Planning and Development Department to approve from our own funds two major projects for the women development and there is no such example in any other province. “We are trying to get support from the federal level for these activities and we hope that we would be in a position to allocate more resources in near future for women development activities”, he said. In the end he thanked the organizers to invite him to workshop and provide an opportunity to share his thoughts.
Concluding remarks and vote of thanks

Ms. Faiza Effendi, Assistant Resident Representative, UNDP, gave her concluding remarks about the workshop proceedings. She congratulated the women development department for organizing the event successfully. She mentioned that she was deeply impressed to see the level of involvement and understanding of those who worked very hard to prepare the recommendations and also the presenter who were able to clearly convey the group views and recommendations about different aspect of the problem. She said that the workshop has set a stage whereby we can now take forward these recommendations to the implementation stage. She highlighted the role for UNDP as a partner into this process and assured that within it’s own limitation the organization is willing to support the cause. She especially noted that as a part of the workshopping process we have varying level of success in different provinces but she found Sindh at a much more advanced stage in terms of concrete recommendations for tackling the women abuse issue in the province. She hoped that the effort and partnership would continue and grow stronger in coming future. In the end she thanked all the participants, the chief guest and the chair for their keen interest in the issue and active participation in the workshop.

Comments and suggestions from the participants

Due to time limitations the duration of the session had to be curtailed however some useful comments and suggestions were made during the open discussion session and are listed below:

- One participant commented that the social audit is a useful exercise, as it provides a population based documentation of the issue and such exercises should be repeated in future.

- The same participant also asked some clarification about the sampling procedures and sample size. Dr. Anne Cockcroft explained that the sampling procedures involved a stratified random sampling which was representative at the national and provincial level. Regarding sample size she mentioned that it provided a sound statistical significance to the findings and was validated through a neutral evaluation by the MOWD.

- One participant made a suggestion that for the sexual abuse cases there should be some laboratory arrangements for a DNA test of sperms as a part of medico-legal report so that in situations where there are false charges of Zinna (illegal sexual relationship), this could help to help woman defend herself.
• One participant was of view that a lot has been said about awareness on family laws and their implementation at the community level. But one should also look what our role models are doing, especially those who are the policy makers and legislators. She said that our public representatives should serve as role models and set examples for the common people.

• Another participant backed up the recommendation about increasing the number of female judges and lawyers in the judiciary. She quoted her own experiences as a lawyer in terms of problems that women face in court.
Social Audit on Abuse Against Women  
Provincial plenary workshop to feedback recommendations on evidence  
List of Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Dept./Org.</th>
<th>E-mail</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Fax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government Departments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghulam Sarwar Khero</td>
<td>Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.)</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211415</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Mahtab Ahmed Rashdi</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Information department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9204415-6</td>
<td>9204416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Yahya Waliullah</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Information Technology Department</td>
<td></td>
<td>9212974</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Aftab Ahmed Memon</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211507</td>
<td>9211890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fahim Akhter</td>
<td>Assistant chief education</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211925</td>
<td>9211402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzma Nazli</td>
<td>Section officer, education</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211919</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fazal Ahmed Nizamani</td>
<td>Chief of health</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211919</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Shah Bux Bhutto</td>
<td>Assistant chief health</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>921427</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shehnaz Siddiqui</td>
<td>Section officer, health</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211427</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hassan Ali Din Muhammad</td>
<td>Chief Advisor</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211413</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azam Sangi</td>
<td>Planning Officer</td>
<td>Planning &amp; Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangal Shasnal</td>
<td>City Councillor</td>
<td>City District Government, <a href="mailto:loemangal@yahoo.com">loemangal@yahoo.com</a></td>
<td></td>
<td>7787431</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Deptt./Org.</td>
<td>E-mail</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hameeda Bano</td>
<td>City councillor</td>
<td>Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>03002276113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City District Government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>5888681</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>03202033200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahnaz Akther</td>
<td>City Councillor</td>
<td>Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>4590379</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City District Government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>03002101646</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>03002466115</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunaiza Qadir</td>
<td>Town councillor</td>
<td>Gulberg Town City District Government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6900072(F)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>03332171279</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feroza Azmat</td>
<td>City Councillor</td>
<td>Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:Feroza_so615de@yahoo.com">Feroza_so615de@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raana Khan</td>
<td>Lawyer (City Councillor)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7774618</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Raees Paracha</td>
<td>EDO E &amp; IP CDGK</td>
<td>E &amp; IP GOO City District Government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>9232095</td>
<td>9232441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms, Farzana Shahnaz</td>
<td>District Officer</td>
<td>Community Development Department, CDG Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>7728232</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shamim Sheikh</td>
<td>Deputy District officer Institutions</td>
<td>Social Welfare Wing, CDG Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>9202635</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Seema Nazli</td>
<td>Deputy district officer (DDO)</td>
<td>Community development Department, City district government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6903349</td>
<td>Off.7523010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Farhunda Hamid</td>
<td>Deputy district officer</td>
<td>Cooperatives, City district Government, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320-5046052</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunaiza Qadir</td>
<td>Town Councillor</td>
<td>Gulberg town, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6315283</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nighfat Fatima</td>
<td>Town Councillor</td>
<td>North Nazimabad town, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6900072</td>
<td>6900072(F)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neelofar Marchant</td>
<td>General Councillor</td>
<td>UC-3, Kharadar, Saddar Town, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>2436500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badar-uddin</td>
<td>Director, Women health project</td>
<td>Health Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>0300-9286804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Sahib Jan</td>
<td>P D WHP</td>
<td>Health Department</td>
<td></td>
<td>8145495</td>
<td>8145171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Ifthkhar</td>
<td>Medical Officer</td>
<td>Health Department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syeda Ghazala</td>
<td>SHO, Women Police station</td>
<td>Police Department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Samra</td>
<td>Head Moharrir, Women police station</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safia Baig</td>
<td>DSP</td>
<td>Sindh Police</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jalees Fatima</td>
<td>DSP</td>
<td>Sindh Police</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Deptt./Org.</td>
<td>E-mail</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Qadir</td>
<td>SSP</td>
<td>Sindh Police</td>
<td></td>
<td>2202833</td>
<td>2202832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neelofar Shahnawaz</td>
<td>Session Judge</td>
<td>City Court, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>9243818</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shahida Shams</td>
<td>Deputy Director</td>
<td>Directorate of Manpower and Training, Govt. of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>6689040 (R)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Iqbal Hasan</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Information department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Qurban Ali Memon</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Social Welfare Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9202627</td>
<td>9205012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Farzana Saleem</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>4544494</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Niamatullah Shaikh</td>
<td>Deputy director</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>4383832</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ashfaque Qadri</td>
<td>Deputy director</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>9213380</td>
<td>4383831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Musarrat Jabeen</td>
<td>Women Development Officer</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>4383832</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Wali Mohammad Qureshi</td>
<td>Women Development Officer</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wali_qureshi@hotamil.com">wali_qureshi@hotamil.com</a></td>
<td>4383832</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Akram Hussain</td>
<td>Women Development Officer</td>
<td>Women Development Department, Government of Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>4538382</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Zeb advocate</td>
<td>Incharge women reporting cell</td>
<td>Women development department</td>
<td></td>
<td>0300 2569795</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Tariq</td>
<td>Women Development officer</td>
<td>Women development department</td>
<td><a href="mailto:spe-ed@cyber.net.pk">spe-ed@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>4312765, 4312455</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Azmat</td>
<td>Superintendent</td>
<td>Women development department</td>
<td><a href="mailto:spe-ed@cyber.net.pk">spe-ed@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>4312765, 4312455</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NGO and civil society representatives**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Deptt./Org.</th>
<th>E-mail</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
<th>Fax</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Farhana Iqbal</td>
<td>Project director</td>
<td>The education foundation (NGO)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:spe-ed@cyber.net.pk">spe-ed@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>4312765, 4312455</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mahmood Ali Khan</td>
<td>Senior staff officer</td>
<td>The education foundation (NGO)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:spe-ed@cyber.net.pk">spe-ed@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>4312765, 4312455</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Deptt./Org.</td>
<td>E-mail</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Mubina Agboatwala</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>HOPE</td>
<td><a href="mailto:agboat@gerrys.net">agboat@gerrys.net</a></td>
<td>4539393</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Adeel Fatima Rizvi</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Sindh educational welfare association</td>
<td>C-121, Block J, North Nazimabad, Karachi <a href="mailto:riz2000@super.net.pk">riz2000@super.net.pk</a></td>
<td>6654721 (O)</td>
<td>6638238 (R)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miss Farhana Iqbal</td>
<td>General Secretary</td>
<td>Male-Mominan multi-purpose cooperative society</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bshs@hotmail.com">bshs@hotmail.com</a></td>
<td>0300-2261705</td>
<td>6989189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Ayesha Kamil</td>
<td>General Secretary</td>
<td>Star educational Cooperative Society</td>
<td></td>
<td>6952532</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Khalid Marchant</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Merchant Welfare society</td>
<td></td>
<td>4927686</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Jabeen Abbas</td>
<td>Assistant Director</td>
<td>PAVHNA</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pavhna@super.net.pk">pavhna@super.net.pk</a></td>
<td>5801401-3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rehana Rashdi</td>
<td>Director Prog.</td>
<td>PAVHNA</td>
<td></td>
<td>5887859(F)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amina Mazhar</td>
<td>Legal research officer (advocate)</td>
<td>LHRLA</td>
<td><a href="mailto:lhrla@fascom.com">lhrla@fascom.com</a></td>
<td>5685824,</td>
<td>111911922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Nargis Rehman</td>
<td></td>
<td>Karachi women peace committee</td>
<td></td>
<td>5866623,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aapa Qamar-un-Niss</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tanzeem-e-Falah-e-Khawateen</td>
<td></td>
<td>5873110</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qamar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Arjumand Rabbani</td>
<td>Programme Director</td>
<td>PAVLNA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summaira</td>
<td>Prog. Sec.</td>
<td>PAWLA</td>
<td></td>
<td>48507614</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aman</td>
<td>Prog. Sec.</td>
<td>PAWLA</td>
<td></td>
<td>48507614</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazir</td>
<td>Prog. Sec.</td>
<td>PAWLA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Najma Siddique</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sirkatgah</td>
<td>F-25-A, Block-9, Clifton</td>
<td>5878341</td>
<td>5836488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Sabiha Shah</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Ladies wing, Lyari Community</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pwpp@super.net.pk">pwpp@super.net.pk</a></td>
<td>7521687</td>
<td>7549576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Shah Wawaz</td>
<td>General Sec.</td>
<td>Seva Social Welfare, Development Project</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Murad1@cyber.net.pk">Murad1@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>5681659</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Salma Waheed Murad</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Chamber of Commerce and Industries, Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>0333-2117154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Farida Mian</td>
<td>Chairperson,</td>
<td>Mother &amp; Child health Care, Behbood Association</td>
<td></td>
<td>5862093</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Deptt./Org.</td>
<td>E-mail</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Anjum Waris Khan</td>
<td>Vice President</td>
<td>Behbood Association, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>5862093</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Farzana Rehman</td>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>Public relations &amp; Publications, APWA</td>
<td></td>
<td>7212991</td>
<td>7217931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shamim Kazmi</td>
<td></td>
<td>ABP &amp; AW</td>
<td></td>
<td>4536165</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Afreen Khizra Niazi</td>
<td>Research Assistant</td>
<td>Raasta Development consultants</td>
<td></td>
<td>5870735</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Kausar Hashmi</td>
<td>Research officer</td>
<td>Raasta Development consultants</td>
<td></td>
<td>5870735</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahida Sajid Ali</td>
<td>Associate for capacity building</td>
<td>B-457, sector 11-A, North Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>5870735</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Naheed Abro</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Women Development Association, Badin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hamidamasood@hotmail.com">hamidamasood@hotmail.com</a></td>
<td>0333-2259323</td>
<td>02346-43496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Erum Abro</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Women Development Association, Badin</td>
<td></td>
<td>4992567</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Hamida Masood Shah</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Women welfare association Sanghar, Sindh</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hamidamasood@hotmail.com">hamidamasood@hotmail.com</a></td>
<td>02346-43496</td>
<td>43496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Masood H Shah</td>
<td>Member WWA</td>
<td>Women welfare association Sanghar, Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>02346-41325</td>
<td>43496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Mehmooda Sultana</td>
<td>Board Member</td>
<td>Women welfare association Sanghar, Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320-4089260</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasreen Roohi Soomro</td>
<td>Representative women wing</td>
<td>Sindh Graduate Association</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320-4089260</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shohrat Khatoon</td>
<td>Executive Director Principal</td>
<td>Basti</td>
<td></td>
<td>4310514</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Farzana Yasmeen Butt</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>APWA Govt. college for Women, Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>4983794</td>
<td>9246095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shakra Zaki</td>
<td>Gen. Sec.</td>
<td>Anjuman Mufad e aama</td>
<td></td>
<td>4389714</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shamim Ch.</td>
<td>Gen. Sec.</td>
<td>Anjuman Mufad e aama</td>
<td></td>
<td>6680525</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Balqis Bano</td>
<td>Gen. Sec.</td>
<td>Now abad Coperrative housing society</td>
<td></td>
<td>7526523</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed Malik</td>
<td>Repoter</td>
<td>PPI</td>
<td></td>
<td>2634376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Shamim Bano</td>
<td>Reporter</td>
<td>The NEWS</td>
<td></td>
<td>2634376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Socorro Reyes</td>
<td>Se. General Advisor</td>
<td>UNPDP</td>
<td></td>
<td>2634376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roohi Shoab</td>
<td>Prog. Coordinator</td>
<td>GSP/UNDP</td>
<td></td>
<td>2800133</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faiza Effendi</td>
<td>Assistant Resident</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td></td>
<td>2800133</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saba Perveen</td>
<td>Research representative</td>
<td>Women Studies Centre</td>
<td></td>
<td>2800133</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Deptt./Org.</td>
<td>E-mail</td>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aliyah Ali</td>
<td>Lecturer</td>
<td>K V Women Studies Center</td>
<td></td>
<td>8117268</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rifat Mughal</td>
<td>Advocate</td>
<td>Pakistan Women Lawyer Association</td>
<td></td>
<td>5897958</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Jamil Siddiqui</td>
<td>Chief Resident</td>
<td>Services Hospital Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>9215753</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Habibur Rehan</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>Engineering Department</td>
<td></td>
<td>051 5566966</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qamarul Haq Saddique</td>
<td>Reporter PRU</td>
<td>PAMA Photo News Agency</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Qamarasddiqi@yahoo.com">Qamarasddiqi@yahoo.com</a></td>
<td>0320 4097187</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuzhat Shah</td>
<td>Laywar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0303 7299452</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rao Tahir</td>
<td>VP</td>
<td>UBL</td>
<td><a href="http://www.UBL.com.pk">www.UBL.com.pk</a></td>
<td>0320 2737140</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saleem</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nabat Haque</td>
<td>Doctor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6609092</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rafia Haider</td>
<td>Reporter</td>
<td>APP</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Haiders@cyber.net.pk">Haiders@cyber.net.pk</a></td>
<td>0300 8290778</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rnshil</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5693801-5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bushra Syeed</td>
<td>Staff Reporter</td>
<td>Public News Karachi</td>
<td><a href="mailto:publicnewspk@yahoo.com">publicnewspk@yahoo.com</a></td>
<td>7790127-8</td>
<td>7790291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abida</td>
<td>H Wife</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4964051</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saif</td>
<td>Doctor</td>
<td>CHK Karachi</td>
<td></td>
<td>6605092</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Irum Fazal</td>
<td>Reporter</td>
<td>IMC GEO</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320 4220156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S S A Rizvi</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Global HelpLine</td>
<td></td>
<td>8147203</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zia</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Helpway</td>
<td></td>
<td>8144083</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shiraz</td>
<td>Chief</td>
<td>Creative act protection</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320 4004500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahzad Pervaz</td>
<td>Assistant Director</td>
<td>Sports Department</td>
<td></td>
<td>0320 5072255</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalsoom Sultana</td>
<td>TV Artist</td>
<td>PTV</td>
<td></td>
<td>4944859</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badar</td>
<td>Section Officer</td>
<td>Agriculture Department</td>
<td></td>
<td>9211532</td>
<td>9211469</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SAAAW final report. Annex 6
Balochistan plenary workshop

Minutes of the plenary workshop, Quetta 24 June 2004, Conference hall block-08, Balochistan civil secretariat

Participants

The list of participants is appended at the end of the minutes. The participants included representatives of provincial government departments, different NGOs, advocates, members of district council and media.

Proceedings

Miss. Shumayal Aziz, the In-Charge National Plan of Action (NPA) in Social Welfare & Women Development department (SW/WDD) welcomed the honorable chief guest, Secretary SW/WD department, Deputy Secretary SW/WD and other respected guests. The formal proceedings of the provincial workshopping meeting commenced with recitation from Holy Qu’ran, followed by a brief session for the participants to introduce themselves.

After a brief introductory session, Miss Farkhanda Aurangzaib (Representative of Women Studies Center, University of Balochistan) in her welcome address elaborated about the theme of provincial plenary workshop and appreciated the valuable contribution of all the four technical working groups. She also highlighted the importance of input by the groups contributed during months-long workshopping process in the province.

Dr. Anne Cockcroft, CIET Country Programme Manager, gave a presentation on components and progress of SAAAW. She explained about social audit cycle, and different phases of SAAAW initiative. Further she presented details regarding SAAAW sampling, piloting, and field process. She also shared about the topics covered in different survey instruments. Sharing SAAAW survey findings she mentioned about women’s perception of abuse and risk factors that reduce women’s risk of suffering different forms of abuse.

Miss. Shaheena Ahmed, Section Officer SW/WD shared about how Women Development Department has facilitated the SAAAW workshopping process. She mentioned about the formation of four technical working groups to discuss findings related to:
Miss. Shaheena also briefly explained about the next steps of SAAAW.

**Presentations by SAAAW technical working groups**

The four technical working groups presented sector-specific findings and the policy recommendation arising from their discussion during workshopping meetings. The details are given in the action recommendation formats completed by the working groups during the workshopping process which are attached as an annex. The groups gave their presentations as per the following sector-specific topics:

**Group 1: Economic status and employment factors**

Prof. Naila Qasdri and Dr. Irum represented the group that worked out policy recommendations related to “economic status and employment opportunities”. The recommendations were summarized under the following main areas:

- Improving the work place environment especially for women
- Protecting women with an income from abuse
- Protecting women with employment outside the household from abuse
- Women’s economic empowerment

**Group 2: Education of men and women**

This group was represented by Mir Aurangzaib, advocate, and Mrs. Gulnoor Bugti. The action recommendations by the group were presented according to the following lines:

- Awareness/advocacy campaign to support education.
- Gender-specific school curriculum
- Adult Non-formal education
- Role of NGOs & CBOs in promotion education
- Role of leaders and influential people in promotion of education
- Creating a conducive environment for good education

**Group 3: Attitude and cultural practices**

Representing their group, Ms Tayyaba and Ms Samina Saeed presented the findings and recommendations of the group as follows:

- Prevention of early marriages
- Ensuring women’s consent for marriage
- Changing traditions on exchange marriage
- Changing traditions on bride prices and dowry
- Discouraging polygamy
• Increasing women’s mobility outside home
• Changing perceptions about justification for violence

Group 4: Confiding and reporting abuse

Mr. Ayaz Baloch and Humera Rabel presented the findings and action recommendations on behalf of the technical working group on “confiding and reporting abuse”. Their presentation covered the following areas:
• Creating a conducive environment to facilitate reporting of abuse
• Institutional services and systems to facilitate reporting of abuse

Plenary discussion

After the presentations by all the four groups, the chief guest and CIET team facilitated an open plenary discussion. The participants were invited to share their views and ask questions. The comments, questions, recommendations by different participants and some responses to participants’ questions are mentioned here:

• Mir Aurangzaib, Advocate Supreme Court, commented that as mentioned during one of the presentations, illiteracy is a major reason for abuse against women. He was of the view that violence against women is initiated as much by women as than men. He also pointed out that both men and women can be the victim of violence. He said there was a need to analyze factors related to both the genders to reduce and overcome abuse against women. He also said that strong efforts should be made to have proper legislation with a concept of punishment for those who abuse women and to ensure its effective implementation.

• A female participant representing education department gave her recommendation that promotion of some indigenous practices and values can bring a positive change to reduce abuse against women.

• Commenting on the practice of polygamy a participant agreed with the working group’s recommendation that a man should seek consent of first wife. He noted that Shariat court and family laws already have provisions on this, which should be enforced.

• One of the working group members noted that if any woman does not bring a handsome dowry she would not be able to live a comfortable life or get due regard from her in-laws. So it is useful to fix a suitable quantity of dowry which ensures a woman’s status as an important member of her in-laws family.

• A participant raised a concern that most of our population consists of rural or disadvantaged areas. But conducting workshops and seminars in headquarters brings the urban or vocal women in focus. She suggested that we should not overlook the representation of our majority population in such activities and should also plan to have this type of workshop session in rural areas. CIET team explained about the survey sample and mentioned that the survey was conducted throughout the country and the
data were collected from the households of both urban and rural communities, according to their proportions in the population. The voice of rural women is fully represented in the findings, both from the household survey and from the focus group discussions in all the sample communities.

- Former chief secretary Balochistan Mr. Faeqer Mohammed Baloch thanked the team for inviting him to this informative gathering and appreciated the team for the collection of informative and useful data. He was of the view that violence against women occurs because we have deviated from Islamic teachings and the whole world in fact is violating the basic tenents of their religions. He said that human principles, codes of ethics and Quranic teachings are neglected. Because of this ambiguity has arisen within our lives. He emphasized on the importance of understanding Islamic thoughts by the society. He quoted a Quranic verse whereby men are held responsible for women’s security and economic matters. He suggested that we as society members should all play a role to preach the Islamic teachings for a better world.

- Ms. Bilqees Tahira representing the Education Dept mentioned that women’s work especially within the household is not recognized. Women are not allowed to work outside the home though in history we have examples of various Muslim ladies such as Hazrat Khadija and Hazrat Ayesha and other noble women who assisted Muslim males on various occasions outside the home. She felt it was important that the work of women should be properly recognized and equally appreciated.

- Ms Aysha, from Oxfam GB, raised concern that for years we have been listening to recommendations only but no implementation is carried out. Therefore, action recommendations should be translated into practice and implemented. The government should have a leading and effective role to look after the Dar-ul-Aman or crisis centers where abused women are residing. She suggested that psychiatrists should be appointed in these centers for better guidance and emotional support for abused women.

- A woman participant said that abuse cases have been or are being reported more in the urban areas rather than rural communities. She said that although people who are well aware of the women’s problems are around us, still we are facing same problem within our surroundings. She suggested that the education department should take serious actions in this regard to include the texts preaching for a congenial environment for women in the society.

- Commenting on the issue of justification of hitting a woman, Prof Naila Qadri said that this attitude develops in women from an early age. The family setup or the atmosphere within the household leads to an attitude among women to always scarify. Different family members especially elders always emotionally blackmail females. It is why most women justify most forms of abuses as a part of routine. She recommended that women should be given equal status and recognition in society. She also recommended that indigenous bodies such as the Jirga play an important role because the Jirga comprises people who are respected by the whole community. Awareness raising about abuse should be conducted for Jirga members.
During the meeting a participant seconded the recommendation that a series of lectures should be delivered at school and grass root level about women’s rights so that the children especially young girls could know about their rights at very early age.

Another participant suggested that holding of seminars could also be effective to raise awareness. A female said that the lectures should be arranged in the houses of influential people of the community.

One of the participants highlighted the role of the media in creating awareness. The media can play an important role for delivering messages about the rights of women.

A women advocate said that awareness should be raised among males and females of the community. She said that awareness-raising can be done by giving examples of Islamic history that women took part in battles and there was no restriction on their movement outside the houses. The awareness could also be created by giving references of constitutional and legal rights of women.

A woman councillor recommended that at provincial level laws should be introduced that if anyone indulges in violence he/she should be charged. The perception of punishment for wrong doing and reward for good behaviour should be created among the people because it is human psychology that nobody performs any job without the perception of punishment and reward. If the people know that they will be punished for their bad deeds then they do not do them.

Participants agreed that the efforts to change women’s own perception about justification of man/mother-in-laws’ hitting a woman should also be made to change the attitudes of men and senior women.

Address by the chief guest

After the plenary discussion, Mr. Niaz M. Khan Jaffar, secretary social welfare and women development, delivered his address as chief guest. He emphasized that abuse against women is an important issue that needs to be addressed. However, this should be seen in the overall development context. He further mentioned that the Balochistan provincial Women Development department has taken the initiative to undertake a process of policy formulation for tackling abuse against women, with a strong evidence base provided from the social audit on abuse against women (SAAAW). The Women Development Department is providing a policy platform for coordination with other government line departments, organizations and institutions on these issues. The chief guest shared that an important aspect of the SAAAW workshopping process to use the evidence as the starting point for policy development is the involvement of both government and non-government partners. He welcomed this collaboration with non-government stakeholders in tackling the problem of abuse against women.
He appreciated the groups’ presentations and supported the action recommendations of the groups. He said that SW/WD department will make all possible efforts to translate the action recommendations arising from the Social Audit on Abuse Against Women into implementation and practice. The secretary thanked the CIET team for assisting the social welfare and women development department in conducting a successful workshopping process.

**Votes of thanks**

Mr. Noor Ansari, the CIET provincial coordinator, expressed the vote of thanks to all the participants and the technical working groups for their support and contribution in conducting a series of workshopping meetings. He also acknowledged the contribution of the SW/WD department for their hard work during the arrangement of the provincial plenary workshop.
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

(Conference hall, Block-08 Civil Secretariat, Quetta)

Provincial government:

1. Niaz Muhammad Khan Jaffar, Secretary SW & WD Dept Balochistan.
   Telephone: 9201458, Fax: 9202402

   Telephone: Res: 827193 Off: 9201705 Mob: 0300 9388123

2. Rehman Khan, Provincial Coordinator, MICS Balochistan, P&D department
   Telephone: Res: 8308096 Off: 0300 3820522

3. Nisar Fatima, Deputy District Officer (Education), Chilton Town.

4. Shahnaz Kousar, ADEO (Chilton Town, Quetta)

5. Ayaz Ahmed Baloch, DSP, CID (Balochistan Police)
   Telephone: Res: 442780, Off: 9203916, Mob: 0300 8382107
   Fax: 9203912, Email address: balochayaz@yahoo.com

6. Akbar Ali, Director Civil Defense, Home & Tribal Affairs Department.
   Telephone: Res: 830114, Off: 660818

7. Tasneem Akhtar, Principal, L.Manpower & Training Balochistan.
   Telephone: Res: 826199, Off: 9201112

8. Musarrat Saleem Tareen, A.D.W.D (Social welfare Department, Balochistan.
   Telephone: Res: 853084, Off: 9201685

9. Dr. Muhammad Sallahuddin, District. Coordinator NPFP&PHC, Quetta.
   Telephone: Res: 881230, Off: 9201146, Mob: 0320-5905963
   Email address: M.Sadullah@yahoo.com

10. Shamayal Aziz, Incharge NPA - SW/Women Development Department
    Telephone: Off: 9201041

11. Dr. Iram Saba, Vet Officer, Livestock and Dairy Development, Balochistan.
    Telephone: Res: 855930, Off: 9201324, Mob: 0300 3814199
    Email: drsabamalik@yahoo.com
13. Rahila Berlass, Superintendent, Social welfare Department. Telephone: Off: 853529
14. Mohammad Ibrahim, Deputy Secretary, Social Welfare Department. Telephone: Res: 442637, Off: 9201458, Mob: 0333 7808561, Fax: 9202402
15. Mohammad Rashid, Section officer, Home Department Balochistan. Telephone: 9201901, Fax: 920135
16. Anila Ahmed, Assistant In-Charge NPA SW/WD Dept. Telephone: 9201041
17. Imran Hussain, NPA SW/WD Dept. Telephone: 9201041
18. Ali Sohail, NPA SW/WD Dept. Telephone: 92010141
19. Mr. Atta, PS to Deputy Secretary SW/WD Dept. Telephone: 9201458
20. Hafiz Abdul Qayyum, Pesh Imam Mosque in Balochistan Civil Secretariat Quetta.

_District Government:_

21. Samina Saeed, Lawyer/ Member City District Council Quetta. Telephone: Res: 837271 Off: 821810 Mob: 0320 4787248
22. Tayaba Altaf Advocat, Member City District Council, Quetta. Mob: 0300 3813036
23. Gul Noor Bugti, District Council Member Quetta city (L.G & GNRS) Telephone: Res: 440891 Off: 440891 Mob: 0320 4786269

_NGOs/Civil Society Representatives:_

24. Fauzia Shaheen, GADS/ SDRB/UNDP Telephone: Off: 828870, Mob: 0333 7805428 Fax: 828870, Email: fazia_shaheen@yahoo.com
25. Atta Mohammad, Gen.Secy, Society for Education, Health and Human Dev Telephone: Res: 838645, Off: 855444, Mob: 0333 7800556, Email: atta_nae@yahoo.com
26. Sumera Jamal, Programme Officer Aurat Foundation, Quetta. Tel: 824070 Off: 833647 Mob: 0333-7814683, Email: arshian@hotmail.com
27. Prof. Naela Quadri, Director Gidan / Women’s Crisis center Quetta. Telephone: Off: 834464 Mob: 0300 381577, Email: naela_quadri@yahoo.com

28. Aysha Ayub, Programme officer, OXFAM GB Tel: 825991, Off: 825708 Fax: 832990, Email: aayub@oxyam.org.pk

29. Mir Aurangzeb, President LAWS, Advocate Supreme Court Pakistan. Telephone: Res: 826492, Off: 821810, Mob: 0333 7802076, Fax: 826492 Email: miraurangzab@yahoo.com

30. Faqir Mohammad Baloch, President Senior citizens / Pensioners Association Quetta Telephone: Res: 829643 Off: 823074

**Media Representatives:**

31. Mrs. Shahida Irshad, Pro. J.W.P Chair Person, Quetta/ Dawn. Tel: 838847 Off: 0333-7808027, Email: dawnngo1995@hotmail.com

32. Dur-e-Shahwar, Editor weekly Dastak Telephone: Off: 666366, Mob: 0300 3846686

33. Rashid Chohan, The Daily Balochistan Times Quetta and Programme Coordinator Aurat Foundation Quetta Telephone: 828230 Off: 833647 Mob: 0333 7803418 Fax: 8333649 Email: rs_chohanqta@yahoo.com

**Individuals:**

34. Abdul Basit, Advocate Mob: 0300 2843437

35. Uzma Akhtar, Student Government Poly Technical College Quetta. Telephone: Off: 447527

36. Saba Zeidi, Lecturer (English) Telephone: 9201377

37. Humera Rabeil, Advocate, Bar Council Balochistan. Telephone: 821810

38. Balquis Tahira, consultant Tel: 051-2875990, Mob: 0333 5109228, Email: ainee@cosmats.net.pk

40. Aysha Baig, Student G.P.I. for girls Quetta
   Telephone: Res: 831540, Off: 9211629, Mob: 0300 3845747

Semi-Government Departments:

41. Sarah Hameed, Person Staff Officer /lecturer SBK Women University Balochistan
   Telephone: Off: 9201377 Fax: 856180 Email: esshameed@yahoo.com

42. Samiullah, Assistant S.B.K.Women University Balochistan
   Telephone: Off: 9201377

43. Farkhanda Aurangzab, Director, Women’s Studies center, Balochistan University.
   Telephone: Res: 826492, Off: 9211221, Mob: 0300 9381203
   Fax: 9211221-826492 Email: Prof_Farkhanda@yahoo.com

44. Mrs. Sumera Saleem, Sub-Manager, First Women bank Quetta.
   Telephone: Off: 824202 Fax: 824202

45. Shaan S. Tareen, Director Allama Iqbal Open University R/C Quetta
   Telephone: Res: 663823, Off: 674429, Mob: 0320-4796822

CIET team:

46. Faisal Baloch, regional coordinator CIET in Pakistan
   Mob: 0300-3818711, Email: faisalmangal@yahoo.com

47. Fayyaz Hussain, regional coordinator CIET in Pakistan
   Telephone: Res: 830433, Email: fhmurad63@hotmail.com

48. Manzoor Baloch, district coordinator CIET in Pakistan
   Telephone: Res 826322

49. Salma Shahwani, quality control coordinator CIET in Pakistan
   Telephone: Res: 447527

50. Noor M. Ansari, provincial coordinator CIET in Pakistan
    Mobile: 0320-4787078, Email: nansari@ciet.org

51. Dr. Anne Cockcroft, Country Programme Manager CIET in Pakistan
    Telephone: 051-2875608, Email: cietpakistan@ciet.org
**NWFP plenary workshop**

Plenary Workshop to feedback policy recommendations arising from findings of the Social Audit of Abuse Against Women (SAAAW)

26th June 2004, 9.30am-1.40pm, Department of Geography, U&RP, University of Peshawar

The meeting started with the recitation of the Holy Qu’ran. Dr Amir Khan delivered the opening address and explained the objectives of the workshop. Dr. Anne Cockcroft presented the SAAAW methods and basic findings, using a slide presentation.

Dr. Mohammad Javed, Registrar University of Peshawar, expressed his views. He said that it is very important to carry out this sort of research to learn about the real situation in society. There is a need for more such research. He said that without basic data no effective policies can be developed. He was pleased to know that data collected by students and faculty of the University of Peshawar will be used for formulating policies. Such interaction between government and academia is very crucial. The university will be providing maximum support for continued collaboration in social audit. He passed on the congratulations of the Vice Chancellor who unfortunately was not able to attend because of other important meetings.

Dr Amir Khan introduced the workshopping process, explaining that four groups had worked on issues of education, economics and employment, culture and attitude, and reporting of abuse. These four groups met regularly during the month of June in the university to discuss the issues and formulate their recommendations.

Ms. Safia Amjad presented the recommendations from the working group on economic and employment factors.

Mr. Farman Ali presented the recommendations of the working group on education.

Ms. Rubina Khilji, presented the recommendations of working group on socio-cultural attitudes and practices.

Ms. Farah Jamshaid presented the recommendations from the working group on reporting of abuse.

**Plenary discussion**

One participant said he would not agree that poverty is the only problem causing violence. In the view of another participant the middleman should not be cut out in the marketing of products as suggested by the working group on economic employment factors. He also said that there are 3.5 billion rupees for Zakat fund and we have utilized very little of it. The Zakat
system should be reformed and improved. He also added that Pesh Imams should be requested to attend further workshops, in view of their key role as suggested by most of the groups.

Another participant expressed his views about reporting abuse. He said that in his view a man staring at a woman is not abuse. He also commented that his mother has faced abuse of different kinds from his father; if she had reported this abuse she would have been divorced. He said that it is important to reflect on the reason why a man abuses a woman. He said it is obviously also due to women, as they are responsible for education of children about these issues.

Dr. Amir Khan clarified that it is not CIET that is suggesting staring at a woman is abuse. This is the view of the 23,000 women included the survey, almost all of whom said they thought a man staring at a woman is a form of abuse.

Another participant said that there has been no previous large scale research on this issue in Pakistan. He disagreed with the previous speaker, saying “We haven’t done anything and even can’t do anything, but if somebody does such research we say and think negatively about them”.

A participant asked if there was any cross verification of the data from the social audit on abuse against women. Dr Cockcroft explained some of the quality control procedures and the double data entry procedures, and noted that the focus group discussions provide validation and context for the quantitative findings from the household survey. Another participant said that this is the first national survey of abuse against women in Pakistan so there is no other study for cross-verification.

One participant expressed his views that a girl in our society is not treated as a boy is treated with regard to education, food, clothes, etc. But in spite of all this, we tell people that girls have equal rights. He also said that we only highlight the violence but we don’t show the reasons behind the violence. He further said that violence comes from adverse economic circumstances (e.g. stress creates violence).

Another participant said that it is better to talk about the role of the Mosque as an institution rather than focus only on the role of the Pesh Imam. He felt that abuse in increasing and can only be reduced by actions in the community. He considered education, especially religious teaching, is the most important way to tackle the problem of abuse.

Ms. Nighat Nisa from DFID explained that CIET has conducted this research on behalf of the Ministry of Women Development and the provincial departments of women development. It is specifically and clearly a Pakistani activity.
Dr. Socorro Reyes, senior gender adviser, UNDP, said that the Masalihati Anjumans constituted a valid alternative for intervention at the community level. She observed that there are only a few active Masalihati Anjumans and that more should be activated. She also said that there is a need for capacity building programmes for members of Musalihati Anjumans and others.

**Speech of chief guest**

At the end of the meeting Chief Guest Amir Gulab Khan, secretary Law, Parliamentary Affairs and Human Rights, expressed his views. He thanked the SAAAW team for their hard work in collecting this important information. He said that he belonged to and worked in Malakand, and that he knew how difficult it is to enter in a Pattan house and collect data from an individual who is facing abuse. He said that these data collected from the field are a reflection of the ground reality. Based on these data, there is need to take bold actions to eliminate abuse against women. “We have to face the ground realities” he said. “This is a Muslim society. Women are abused and men are abusers. Both are Muslims. Islam does not endorse abuse. All human being are important and equal in Islam. Therefore if we follow the divine law there will be no question of abuse. But if we follow the man made law then there may be the chances of abuse. Therefore, we should look at the divine law. Islam has given an excellent status to women. Islam is deadly opposed to abuse of women.”

He went on to say that economic status and economic independence are very important. A woman gets one –eight of the property as mother, half share as daughter compare to brother; one forth form her husband if he has no children and a handsome amount as dowry. Abuse can also be reduced by improving the economic status of women and making them more economically independent. He said education should be compulsory for both males and females. Bold steps have to be taken to reduce the abuse of women.

He also referred to the steps which the government of NWFP is taking to help the position of women and reduce their risk of abuse. A statute to establish a Government women’s Kwateen Medical college and University in Peshawar is soon to go before the NWFP assembly. The NWFP government is providing free uniform and free books for girls up to middle grade and will make education compulsory once all facilities are there. They are setting up a literacy programme using unemployed graduates, with suitable monitoring. The Law department is introducing three new laws: one to enforce a woman’s risk of ownership of her property (whoever refuses to give her possession will be punishable); one to
strengthen prevention of violence against women (if a man uses a plea of justification for the violent act he will risk a higher penalty); and one to reduce hasty divorces (it will not allow divorce by three times taliq all at once, there will have to be a gap and an opportunity for reconciliation). The law preventing early marriages will be made operational (no cases have been brought under this law of 1938). The (Nikah) marriage as an important place in society, and encourages good relations between men and women within marriage. The police cannot be everywhere; the way to prevent abuse is to follow God’s law. He gave his strong encouragement to this work on abuse against women: “Go ahead boldly. God will reward you.”

**Vote of thanks**

Rabia Khattak of UNDP expressed her views about the project. She said that this workshop being held at the university was an indication that the findings of SAAAW have been accepted, and the ownership of the process within NWFP has been strengthened. Then she thanked all participants in the plenary workshop.
Plenary Workshop to feedback policy recommendations arising from findings of the Social Audit of Abuse Against Women (SAAAW)
26th June 2004, 9.30am-1.40pm, Department of Geography, U&RP, University of Peshawar
List of participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation/Occupation</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mr. Amir Gulab Khan</td>
<td>Sectary Law, parliamentary affairs and human rights</td>
<td>Law Deptt, GoNWFP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mr. Muqeeem</td>
<td>RO</td>
<td>NIPA, Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mr. Massab Farooq</td>
<td>CEO</td>
<td>Quaprit Technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mr. S.M. Ali Khan</td>
<td>Research Associate</td>
<td>NIPA, Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. Rashid Khan</td>
<td>Chairman Deptt of Sociology</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. M. Taieb</td>
<td>Lecturer Deptt of Anthropology</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Mr. Khurram Aslam</td>
<td>Manager IT</td>
<td>University Town Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Mr. Nimmer Zaman</td>
<td>Asstt Coordinator</td>
<td>IUCN Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Mr. Tahir Hayat</td>
<td>Programme Supervisor</td>
<td>HRMDC Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ms. Rukhsana Aziz</td>
<td>Programme Officer/Lawyer</td>
<td>Aurat Foundation Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Nosomeen Sahibzada</td>
<td>Prov.Coordinator</td>
<td>Pakistan Family Protection Project peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Mr. Farooq Babar</td>
<td>SSP</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Mr. Khursheed H</td>
<td>Deputy Commandant</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Ms. Safia Amjad</td>
<td>Assist Professor</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Mr. Prof. Dr. Taj Ali</td>
<td>Chairman Deptt of Archaeology</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Mr. Nayyar Mujtaba</td>
<td>S.H.O Police</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Mr. Farman Ali</td>
<td>Prog. Coordinator</td>
<td>HRMDC Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Ms. Jahan Ara</td>
<td>Supervisor</td>
<td>Social welfare deptt, Govt of NWFP Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Mr. Mushtaq</td>
<td>Associate Professor (Eco deptt)</td>
<td>Agricultural University Pesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. Mir Kalan</td>
<td>Director, IDS</td>
<td>Agricultural University Pesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Mr. Shaukat Ayaz</td>
<td>CAWIRA</td>
<td>Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Mr. Adeel</td>
<td>Children and women rights</td>
<td>Warsak Road Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Designation</td>
<td>Institution/Role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Ms. Shaista Dilawar</td>
<td>Lecturer</td>
<td>Jinnah College Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Ms. Fozia Anjum</td>
<td>M.Phil Student/Lecturer FEF</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Mr. Taimur Khan</td>
<td>Asstt. Prof. Deptt of Geography</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Mr. Mohsin H. Dar</td>
<td>Programme Coordinator</td>
<td>ActionAid Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Mr. M. Ayaz Khan</td>
<td>Assitt Director</td>
<td>Directorate of Education Govt of NWFP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Ms. Rabia Noor</td>
<td>ALD</td>
<td>Law Department Govt of NWFP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. Amir Nawaz</td>
<td>Professor deptt of Geography</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Mr. Alimaan Shah</td>
<td>CAWIRA</td>
<td>Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. M. Akram</td>
<td>Chairman(Extent ion.Edu.deptt)</td>
<td>Agricultural University Pesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Mr. Mueen-ul-Islam</td>
<td>Manager Admin</td>
<td>Quaprit Technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Mr. Sohail Saeed</td>
<td>Data Manager CIET</td>
<td>Karachi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Ms. Gul-e-Rana</td>
<td>Facilitator, PIA/ M.Phil Student</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Ms. Fazeelat</td>
<td>CIET/ M.Phil Student</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Ms. Shukria</td>
<td>CIET/ M.Phil Student</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Mr. Irfan Jalil</td>
<td>CIET Regional Coordinator</td>
<td>Harripur Hazara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Mr. Dr. Amir Khan</td>
<td>Chairman/Pro.Coordinator CIET</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Press clippings from plenary workshops
Punjab press clippings

‘Emancipation of women vital to development’

By Our Reporter

LAHORE, June 11: Punjab Human Rights and Women Development Minister Ashifa Riaz Fatyana has said women would get their rights by promoting understanding and awareness and not confrontation with men.

She was speaking at a one-day workshop on “Social audit of abuse against women” here on Friday.

The minister said gender discrimination always began at home when even the educated mothers discriminated between their sons and daughters. Parents wanted a son because they believed that he would support them. They don’t pay attention to educate their daughters, she added.

Ms Fatyana said emancipation of women was necessary for social development as they comprised half the population. One-half of society was dragging the other which it had incapacitated due to lack of awareness of the economic realities.

She said the rights of women had been protected in the Holy Quran as well as the constitution. A rigorous imprisonment for three months had been prescribed for harassing a woman and six months for slapping her in an ordinance promulgated in 2002.

United Nations Gender Support Programme senior adviser Dr Socorro L. Reyes said gender violence was a global problem so was the failure to address it effectively through the formal criminal justice system. Very few cases of physical aggression, sexual abuse and harassment were reported, fewer still reached the courts and much fewer ended in convictions because the victims rarely used the formal mechanisms of police and courts for seeking justice because of high cost and delay by police and judicial authorities.

She said the UNDP recommended support for alternative dispute resolution mechanisms likeconciliation committees and community supported mechanisms for tackling the gender violence problem in the countries where disadvantaged groups were reluctant to approach the courts due to case backlog, complex procedures, high cost of litigation, illiteracy and cultural barriers.

She said studies in Pakistan had revealed that nearly two-thirds of women had experienced some form of abuse, including beatings, acid-throwing, burning and rape, but only a few cases had been reported to police. A recent survey by Social Abuse Against Women revealed that only 3 per cent victims contacted the police and only 2 per cent had ever gone to the courts.

Women said men could get the cases filed by bribing the police but they did not have the money for the purpose.

She said a research had revealed that 60 per cent of women felt ashamed, embarrassed and humiliated while attending the courts, 80 per cent disadvantaged as litigants and 84 per cent humiliated by excessive stering and remarks in courts.

She supported the dispute resolution through the conciliation courts and Insaaf committees set up under the Local Government Ordinance. The informal jirga system had not worked for women because it had enforced seclusion and submission to men many of whom controlled them violently. Sindh High Court had banned all jirga trials in the province due to involvement of karo kari killings.

Dr Anne Cockcroft said 95 per cent of 23,431 women, 8,102 elderly ladies and 1,572 interviewed by a research group had revealed that 95 per cent considered staring by women as abuse, 91 restriction on activity, 97 slapping and use of foul language. Mothers-in-law were also blamed for instigating violence against their daughters-in-law by some.

Abuse often affected the family life.

Provincial Social Welfare and Women Development secretary Saeed Ahmad Khan said ensuring correction of the culprits was more important for discouraging violence against women than the enhancement of punishment.

He said the government was taking steps for increasing employment opportunities for women in the public sector.
Abuses against women
Religious leaders intervention sought

BY OUR STAFF REPORTER
Lahore—"Mechanisms within the local government system should provide for a remedy to let the women have a safe and acceptable place in the society, enabling them to report abuse and seek justice," the Minister for Women Development, Mrs. Asifa Riaz Fatyma, said Thursday. She was speaking as chief guest at the "workshop for feedback of policy recommendations from findings of the Social Audit of Abuse Against Women" organised by Community Information Empowerment and Training (CIET).

The Minister stressed the need for involving opinion leaders—religious and secular scholars—in effecting a change in social attitudes towards taking serious notice of abuses against women.

"There is a need to convince other family members about the importance of the woman's work and income as a source of support for the whole family," maintained the Minister.

She underscored establishment of "centres where women can report abuses and look for acquiring skilled training and such things as micro-credit," adding, "economic empowerment of women must also include increase in their literacy and negotiation skills."

Dr. Socauro I. Reyes, Senior Gender Adviser UNDP, alluded upon the problems when cases of abuse are not reported—only 5 percent of the women had ever contacted the police and only 2 percent had ever gone to the courts. This happens because the attitude of the police towards the affected party is highly discouraging. She pleaded for involving the cooperation of the Manabiha Anjuman as people have confidence in such informal institutions in respect of resolving their disputes. Dr. Reyes suggested: "the courts should refer settlement cases to the Manabiha Anjuman through the union Nazim."

The discussion at the workshop focused on economic, educational and socio-cultural factors pertaining to abuse. Other issues highlighted on the occasion pertained to problems about reporting abuse, gender violence and alternative dispute resolution.

Ms. Naureen Nazri, Dr. Anne Cockcroft and Mr. Saeed Ahmed Khan also addressed the occasion.
Provincial minister Ashutta Riaz, Dr Soccorpo and other address a seminar held to highlight problems faced by women. —The News photo
Women’s empowerment imperative to combat violence

By Shameen Bano

KARACHI: Mehnaz Akhtar Rashdi, Secretary Information, Government of Sindh, emphasised that economic empowerment of women was the basic and fundamental reality instrumental in reducing violence against women.

She was speaking at an inaugural session of provincial plenary workshops to feed back policy recommendations arising from the findings of The Social Audit of Abuse Against Women (SAAAW) organised by the CIFT (Community Information Empowerment and Training), in collaboration with the Women’s Development Department, Government of Sindh, with the support of UNDP (United Nations Development Programme), on Tuesday at a local hotel.

Keeping in view the peculiar situation of the society, people should specify each other’s problems, she said, adding that Social Audit of Abuse Against Women was a new concept and the efforts made in this direction were laudable.

However, she said that it was not a matter of one day but was a continuous process. It was the responsibility of the state and society, she said, that incidents of abuse against women be nipped in the bud. The legislators, she believed, must come up with some sort of law against this menace.

Lack of education, she contended, was the major cause of women being abused and feeling insecure at the hands of their own family members.

She did not hold men solely responsible for abuse of women, saying that in many cases, it was the women who created an environment within the home which disturbed men mentally thus resulting in different types of abuse such as harsh language and physical assault.

She further said that there were different perceptions of abuse of women. Some women considered more staves from men as abuse which, she opined, could be ignored and tolerated. According to her being assaulted or hurt physically by men fell in the category of women’s abuse.

In a society like ours, she said, both men and women being employed would mitigate and combat anti-social trends such as bastardising of women. Economically empowered and educated women could not spare time for domestic violence, she observed.

Her Employment, she said, was another factor which caused omission in the home and if a woman were allowed to go out to work to cater to her children’s and family requirements, the trend towards maltreatment of women would considerably diminish.

With regard to the establishment of complaint centres, she said it must be ensured by the government that these could provide security and protection to the women coming to register their complaints.

After the recitation of the Holy Quran, Parveen Saleem, Director Women’s Development, Government of Sindh, highlighted the aims and objectives of the SAAAW. There were two sessions of the workshop.

A session was chaired by Ghulam Sarwar Khoso Additional Chief Secretary (Development). Government of Sindh, who emphasised the vital role played by the NGOs in creating awareness among women and their empowerment.

Others who spoke on the occasion included: Dr Anne Cockcroft, Country Programme Manager, CIFT in Pakistan, Dr Sererose L Reyes Senior Gender Adviser, Gender Support Programme, UNDP Pakistan and Fiza Elifendi, Assistant Resident Representative, UNDP Pakistan.
Workshop on 'social audit of abuse against women'
Workshop on abuse against women held

KARACHI (PPI) - Speakers at a workshop on Social Audit of Abuse Against Women on Tuesday said violence against women in Pakistan could be reduced by provision of education, solving economic problems, improved social attitude and better planning.

It was a provincial plenary workshop to feedback policy recommendations arising from findings of "The Social Audit of Abuse Against Women" (SAAAW), organised by CIEF International in collaboration with Women Development Department, Government of Sindh here at a local hotel.

Additional Chief Secretary Ghulam Sarwar Khero, Sindh Information Secretary Ms Mehtab Akbar Rashtai, Secretary Women Development Sindh, Aftab Ahmed Memon, Assistant Representative UNDP Pakistan Ms Faiza Effandi, Senior Gender Advisor UNDP Mr Sooraj L. Reyes, Country Program Manager CIEF in Pakistan, Dr Anne Cockcroft and Director Women Development Ms Farzana Saleem spoke on the occasion.

The social audit report on abuse against women (SAAAW) was also presented in the workshop which was prepared after a countrywide survey. The report was prepared in light of interviews of the women of every age, living in different parts of the country.

Reports say women were being abused both mentally and physically and its ratio was increasing in rural areas of Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP.

Dr Anne Cockcroft, Country Programme Manager CIEF in Pakistan, told that during the survey it was found that women were facing many kinds of violence and men were also educated. There were restrictions on women activities while incidents of slapping and burning were also common.

She said in most areas of Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP honor of the family depends on women.

Additional Chief Secretary Ghulam Sarwar Khero appreciated UNDP, CIEF and Women Development Department (WDD) Sindh for their efforts in identifying the problems of women and for making recommendations to redress their issues. He also thanked the government for paying special attention to the problem.
KARACHI: Speakers at a workshop on ‘Social Audit of Abuse Against Women’ Tuesday said violence against women in Pakistan could only be reduced by provision of education, solving economic problems, improved social attitude and better planning.

It was a provincial plenary workshop to feedBack policy recommendations arising from findings of “The social audit of abuse against women (SAAAW), organized by CIET International in collaboration with Women Development Department, Government of Sindh here at a local hotel. Additional Chief Secretary Ghulam Sarwar Khero, Sindh Information Secretary Ms Meltab Abbar Rashdi, Secretary Women Development Sindh, Atif Ahsan Memnon, Assistant Resident Representative UNDP Pakistan Ms Faiza Ehsani, Senior Gender Advisor UNDP Dr. Sonoro L. Reyes, Country Program Manager CIET in Pakistan Dr. Anne Crockcroft and Director Women Development Ms Fazana Safiyan spoke on the occasion. The social audit report on abuse against women (SAAAW) was also presented in the workshop, which was prepared after a countrywide survey. The report was prepared in light of interview-views of the women of every age living in different parts of the country.

Report says: women were being abused both mentally and physically and its ratio was increasing in rural areas of Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP. Dr. Anne Crockcroft, Country Program Manager CIET in Pakistan, told that during the survey it was found that women were facing many difficulties like men state and gave these: there were restrictions on women’s activities while incidents of slapping and burning were also common.

She said in most of areas of Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP, honor of the family depends on women. Additional Chief Secretary Ghulam Sarwar Khero appreciated UNDP, CIET and Women Development Department (WDD) Sindh for their efforts to identify the problems of women and for making recommendations to redress their issues. He also thanked the government for paying special attention to the problem. He said Sindh Rural Development Program has been launched with Rs500 million to promote education and training in rural areas of Sindh and expressed the hope that the program will improve the situation. He assured Women Development Department to provide full cooperation for the development of women in the province.

“A woman in our country compromises in every situation for the sake of her home and her children,” she said. The main cause of dispute between a wife and husband could increase manifold due to poor economic conditions, she said adding that if a person is jobless and could not fulfill the requirements of his family then there could be disputes, naturally.

Secretary Women Development Department Sindh, Atif Ahmed Memnon also spoke on this occasion and told about the different programs designed by the department for the development of women in the province. He appreciated the cooperation of CIET International and UNDP.—EN Report
Daily KAINAT Karachi
23 JUN 2004

[Text in Urdu]

[Signature]
Abuse against women needs to be addressed in letter and spirit

By Suded Chohan

QUETTA: Provincial Secretary for Social Welfare and Women Development, Captain (Retd) Nazir Jaffar has observed that the abuse against women has emerged as an important issue that needs to be addressed in letter and spirit, however, adding he said, it should be seen within the overall development context.

He said that the Government of Balochistan is committed to all policies and actions that would help uplift the situation of the common, particularly women. However, adding he stressed that there is also a need for support from higher policy levels, especially the federal government in this regard.

Captain (Retd) Nazir Jaffar was addressing the SAAAW provincial plenary workshop organized by the Women Development Department at the Conference ISAL of the Civil Secretariat on Thursday.

The workshop was attended by the representatives of various government, non-governmental institutions, line departments, civil society organizations, besides the lawyers and the representatives of the local government.

The Provincial Minister for Women Development, Mrs. Parveen Magh, was present to grace the occasion. She expressed the need to work collaboratively towards improving the economic status of women to benefit from employment opportunities provided by the government.

She also highlighted the importance of capacity building and awareness-raising initiatives to empower women. Mrs. Magh also expressed her satisfaction with the progress made so far, but emphasized the need for continued efforts.

She encouraged all participants to support women's rights and work towards creating a more inclusive and equitable society.

The workshop focused on various challenges faced by women, including education, health, and economic empowerment. It also addressed the need for stronger legal frameworks to protect women's rights and address violence against women.

The participants shared their experiences and discussed strategies to overcome the challenges faced by women in the region. The workshop concluded with a call for collective action to bring about positive change and ensure the equal rights and opportunities of women.